**SEPTEMBER 17, 2018** 

THE JESUIT REVIEW OF FAITH AND CULTURE 2018 CPA MAGAZINE OF THE YEAR

# A Survivor's Story

Joseph J. Guido

p20

Raising Children in a Broken Church

р**4**2

When 'Nones' Meet Nuns

p26

P36

Avery Dulles, Model Teacher

# Find God's Blessings in Your Life

# with the Ignatian Examen

Transform your prayer practice with our most popular books about the Ignatian Examen. Learn the importance of this daily practice of Ignatian spirituality and how to adapt it to your daily life.

### Both English and Spanish editions are

15% OFF!

Use promo code **4894** to receive 15% off these select titles. Shipping and handling are additional. Offer expires 11/1/2018.



English: PB | 3535-1 | \$9.95 Spanish: PB | 4389-9 | \$9.95



eeo

#### LOYOLAPRESS. A JESUIT MINISTRY

To order visit www.loyolapress.com or call 800.621.1008



The Francis and Ann Curran Center for American Catholic Studies 14th Annual Rita Cassella Jones Lecture

# An Atlas of Another and Difficult World: Gender, Race, and the Church

### M. Shawn Copeland

### Professor of Systematic Theology, Boston College

M. Shawn Copeland is Professor of Systematic Theology at Boston College. An awardwinning writer, Copeland is the author and/or editor of six books including *Enfleshing Freedom: Body, Race, and Being, The Subversive Power of Love: The Vision of Henriette Delille,* and 125 articles, book chapters, reviews, and blog entries on spirituality, theological anthropology, political theology, social suffering, gender, and race.

# Tuesday, October 9, 2018 | 6 p.m.

Tognino Hall, Duane Library | Rose Hill Campus | Fordham University | Bronx, New York For more information or to register, email cacs@fordham.edu. | Free and open to the public





# Why Stay?

It is no secret that this has been an agonizing summer for the church in the United States. Catholics across the country are still reeling from the disclosures of past sexual abuses committed by members of the clergy, as well as the catastrophic failure of many of the church's leaders to protect the most vulnerable among us. And many people are asking why anyone would remain a Catholic in the face of these scandals. It is a fair question.

When I was first appointed editor in chief, I often said that the most important question we would face in the years ahead would concern ecclesiology, that field of theological reflection that seeks to answer the question, what is the church? I still think that today, mainly because someone's answer to the question of whether to stay in the church will depend, in large measure, on what he or she thinks the church is.

For their part, the fathers at the Second Vatican Council answered the question this way: The church of Christ, "constituted and organized in the world as a society, subsists in the Catholic Church, which is governed by the successor of Peter and by the bishops in communion with him." While there are "many elements of sanctification and of truth" in other communities outside of the church's visible reality, "these elements, as gifts belonging to the church of Christ, are forces impelling toward Catholic unity." In other words, while good things and good people can be found everywhere, there is something unique about the Catholic Church and its relationship with Jesus Christ.

Now all of that highfalutin language is not very helpful—unless you happen to believe it. Then it's very helpful. I am one of those people who believe in faith that Jesus Christ founded a church and that it exists in a unique way, even today, in the Catholic Church; that the church is the visible, efficacious sign of the City of God and, as such, is aptly called a sacrament.

But sometimes it is even more important to remember what the church is not. Augustine of Hippo, the fifth-century saint who first described the two cities, the City of God and the City of Man, was drawing a distinction not between two visible organizations but between two invisible realities of the human heart. Put simply, those with evil hearts belong to the City of Man, while those with righteous hearts, said Augustine, belong to the City of God.

While the church is the visible sign of the City of God. the two. strictly speaking, are not the same thing. That is important because it means that the church visible counts among its members men and women who are righteous and men and women who are evildoers. This side of heaven, just who belongs to which city is something definitively known only to God. And whether you are a Catholic or even a priest or a bishop is no guarantee of residency in either. Thus, like all communities populated by human beings, the church involves both good and bad. Just as the good can be very good, sometimes the bad is very bad indeed; in fact, it can be downright evil.

One might ask, however, how the church can be a sacrament and holy when its members do such evil things. That is also a fair question. I find my answer by remembering that what is holy in a sacrament is not ultimately what I bring to it, but what God brings to it. When I am absolved in the sacrament of reconciliation, I don't thereby cease to be a sinner. When I am strengthened by the sacrament of the Eucharist, I don't thereby cease to be weak. When I was confirmed in my baptismal faith by the Holy Spirit, I did not thereby cease to have doubts.

Likewise, our holiness does not determine whether the church is holy. Why? Because we didn't make it holy in the first place. Jesus Christ did that, and he is still doing it. That alone is what makes the church different from any other human association, whether it is a bowling league or a nation-state. Either that difference is real, or it is not. If it is real, then how could I ever leave? If it is not, then why would I ever stay? Why would I care?

In the end, despite my anger, my sorrow, my sinfulness and the sins of others, I stay because I do care. Why do I remain a priest? This summer reminded me of something my father, a retired firefighter, said to me after the 9/11 attacks: "Those firefighters who died in New York," Dad said, "they died running into the building. When there's a fire, Matty, and lives are at stake, somebody has to run into the building."

I stay because the church, in all its glory and misery, is the building God has made our home on Earth. I remain a priest because somebody has to run into the building.

#### Matt Malone, S.J. *Twitter: @americaeditor.*

# 

# GIVE AND TAKE

#### 6 YOUR TAKE Do school vouchers serve the common good?

#### 8 OUR TAKE Pope Francis and the sex abuse crisis; anti-gay violence; the war in Yemen

10 SHORT TAKE Using the abuse crisis to scapegoat gay Catholics is not O.K. Nathan Schneider

# DISPATCHES

 $\mathbf{12}$ 

abuse has hurt all SOCIET

> VIGANÒ'S ACCUSATIONS: WHAT QUESTIONS REMAIN

Infographic: CARA report suggests significant decline in clerical abuse of children

Can Colombian farmers escape from coca cultivation?

Seeking justice for murdered activist Berta Cáceres in Honduras

Italy's bishops step up for stranded migrants

## FEATURES

20

A SURVIVOR'S STORY Danny was abused by a priest at age 13. He never was the same again. Joseph J. Guido

26

AN UNLIKELY ALLIANCE What can nuns and "nones" learn from each other? Kaya Oakes



## FAITH AND REASON

36

THE MODEL OF A CATHOLIC TEACHER Cardinal Avery Dulles at 100 Patrick J. Ryan

# FAITH IN FOCUS

4<sup>2</sup> KEEPING FAITH Why do I keep my children in this broken, hurting church? Kerry Weber

# POEM

51 BURNING MOUTH ATHOS Cameron Alexander Lawrence

# IDEAS IN REVIEW

46

THE RISE OF THE SOCIALLY CONSCIOUS SITCOM From "All in the Family" to "Roseanne" Robert David Sullivan

### BOOKS

How Did Lubitsch Do It?; War on Peace; Catholicism and American Borders in the Gothic Literary Imagination; Social Creature

CULTURE John Mulaney; Hannah Gadsby

# THE WORD

58 Whom do you serve?

The behaviors of Christians could hinder the Spirit's work Michael Simone

# LAST TAKE

62

MARTIN T. MEEHAN Three things I learned from John McCain

# Do school vouchers serve the common good?

In answer to the above question, 65 percent of respondents said that school vouchers did not serve the common good. Many of these respondents noted that school vouchers could deprive public schools of funding and resources. "While school vouchers benefit the better students and more affluent students who have parents able to broach the financial gap between the voucher amount and the cost of private school, what becomes of the students with learning problems or who have a history of poor grades, the very students most in need of quality educators?" wrote Maggie Flynn of Florissant, Mo.

"They are left behind in districts that have been summarily stripped of resources and are, in effect, being shut out of education," said Ms. Flynn. "Tax credits for middleand low-income parents who choose private schools are fine. But taking away resources from the already sinfully underfunded public school to benefit private schools is wrong on every level."

Ann Garry of Bremerton, Wash., said that she worried that the voucher system allowed some students, such as those with learning disabilities, to fall through the cracks. "Non-public schools don't have to accept any student that comes to them. They are able to take 'the cream of the crop,' leaving students who need more help to the public schools. This creates more financial burden on public schools who must accept every child, regardless of ability or behavior, and provide instruction and services on reduced funding but are expected to meet ever-expanding academic expectations."

Thirty-five percent of respondents said they thought school vouchers served the common good. "I feel parents should be able, no matter their income, to send their children to the school they feel is best," said Beth Cornelson of Madison, Wis.

Many said that school vouchers promoted choice for families. "Parents can choose the best schools from a range of options, benefiting students and forcing all schools to be more competitive. Those on the margins of affording private school in a bad district won't have to choose between a home and their children's future," wrote Brendan Anderson of Hicksville, N.Y.



These results are based on reader responses to a poll promoted on Facebook, Twitter and in our email newsletter. Because of rounding, percentages may not add up to 100.

#### Next Steps

Re "The Pattern of Sin is Clear" (Our Take, 9/3): This is an excellent summary of steps that could well take us along the journey of healing the deep wounds inflicted by the tragedy of clerical sex abuse. The changes must be responsive to those who have suffered most. There must be liturgical and ritual seeking of forgiveness. And there must be practices in place to back up any policy created to heal this nightmare. The bishops do not need to wait until their meeting in November to respond, nor should they be the ones crafting the solutions.

Barry Fitzpatrick P

#### Nothing New

These are excellent suggestions, all of which have been suggested before. Until the power structure of the church changes, nothing else will. Let us see what they come up with at the November meeting.

Mary Gail Frawley-O'Dea 🗩

#### Welcoming the Stranger

Re "Three Steps to a More Civil Political Debate," by Daniel Allott (9/3): I do not remember Jesus saying anything about caring for the rich and educated and already privileged people. I do remember Jesus talking about caring for the poor, the sick and the stranger.

Everyone in this country except Native Americans is descended from immigrants. Most of those immigrants came here because they were poor or oppressed or trying to escape war and violence. Just like people are doing now. Jeanne Linconnue

#### **Outspoken Advocate**

Re "The Church Must Rid Its Supply Chains of Modern Slavery, Says Former Vatican Ambassador," by Kevin Clarke (9/3): I am glad that Pope Francis is an outspoken advocate for assisting human trafficking victims. I hope that more people who perpetuate the crime of human trafficking will be prosecuted and that church agencies will do their best to avoid purchasing products made by forced labor.

Tim Donovan 🗩

#### With the Poor

Re "Medellín at 50: A Synod for the Poor," by Hosffman Ospino and Rafael Luciani (9/3): I could not help thinking about all the bishops in Chile who resigned after yet another big sex abuse scandal surfaced within the Catholic Church. The church needs to be for the poor, as Jesus was. It does not need layers of bureaucratic structure between Christ's clear call to pool our resources and help the needy, even if we have to sell our homes to do so. That is the spirit that has long been missing from the church. Efforts to recapture this spirit in Latin America may not be perfect, but they are moving in the right direction; they are efforts to carry out Jesus' message. Jim Lein ●

Re "Helping Catholics Who Struggle With Scrupulosity," by Rachel Ehmke (9/3): While scrupulosity is a real issue, it is not something that overwhelms the vast majority of Catholics—never mind the population at large—in our day and age. Moral laxity and, as many recent popes, including Francis, have pointed out, not even believing there is such a thing as sin is the issue we face, not scrupulosity.

Thomas Szyszkiewicz 🗭

#### Wavering Line

Re "John Irving Wrestles With Religious Themes New and Old," by James Keane (9/3): I do not have to support all of his positions to find John Irving a wonderful illuminator of the wavering line between "my religion" and the true core that it was built to serve. We all need practice, discernment and correction in navigating that line, and he certainly helps! Your article helped confirm how he can do that.

#### Pat McRae 🗩

#### For Him- or Herself

Re "A Libertarian Case for the Common Good," by Stephanie Slade (8/20): Ms. Slade's article avoids any recognition that communitarianism is the bedrock of our community of believers. She does not address how treating government as anathema helps to address environmental concerns. She presents no libertarian solution to growing income disparity or to the materialism that pervades our culture.

John W. Lemega West Hartford, Conn.

Comments drawn from our website, americamagazine.org, and America Media's social media platforms.

Letters to the editor can be sent to letters@americamedia.org. Please include the article title, author and issue date, as well as your name and where you are writing from.

# Pope Francis Must Lead on the Sexual Abuse Crisis

Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò's 11 pages of accusations against Pope Francis and other church leaders have weaponized the church's sexual abuse crisis, shifting the focus from listening to survivors to Vatican intrigues. Yet these new accusations amount to more of the same problem the church already had: priests, bishops and popes who, when they learned of abuse, protected each other rather than the victims.

The recommendations we made when the McCarrick case was first revealed in July, and after the Pennsylvania grand jury report was released in August, still stand: The church must prioritize listening to survivors of abuse and seeking justice for them. Clear public mechanisms to report abuse and misconduct and to discipline bishops who fail in their duties must be established. The church must undertake a comprehensive, transparent accounting of its tragic failures over the past decades and conduct and cooperate with any necessary investigations.

To achieve true reform, Pope Francis must give this crisis his full focus. His letter to the church and his statements in Ireland are a start, but he

must follow through and make them concrete. Francis' refusal to respond to the Viganò accusations may be an attempt to stay above the fray rather than dignify a venomous ideological attack. Nonetheless, the pope's refusal is an insufficient pastoral response for a church that is deeply wounded. The best way for Pope Francis to respond to the attempt to use the sexual abuse crisis as a weapon in the culture war is to be honest and humble himself, as he ultimately was in his response to abuse survivors in Chile, and to lead the church in caring for those who are hurting the most.

## 'Panic' Is No Justification for Violence

panic," or perceiving "Gay an unwanted sexual overture from someone of the same sex or from a transgender person, has been used as a criminal defense for acts of violence going back to at least the 1950s in the United States. While it rarely results in acquittal, it may be a factor in many relatively light sentences given to those convicted of killing L.G.B.T. people, such as the 12-year manslaughter sentence given to a New York man who beat a transgender woman to death in 2013.

Last month Senator Ed Markey and Representative Joe Kennedy III, both Democratic members of Congress from Massachusetts, introduced the Gay & Trans Panic Defense Prohibition Act, which would prohibit the use of the gay panic defense in federal court (although it would permit the evidence of "prior trauma" to justify a defendant's actions). "Legal loopholes written into our laws that seek to justify violent attacks against our gay, lesbian, bisexual and transgender neighbors should never have existed in the first place," Representative Kennedy told The Washington Blade.

Prosecutions for such attacks are usually handled at the state level, but a federal law would send a strong message that fear of, or discomfort with, any group of people is not a license for violent behavior. Currently, the gay panic defense has been banned only by California, Rhode Island and Illinois, but we hope that other states follow their lead.

Perhaps as significant, the federal bill would also require the U.S. attorney general to produce an annual report on prosecutions in federal court for crimes committed against L.G.B.T. people "that were motivated by the victim's gender, gender identity or expression, or sexual orientation." This would be valuable information for determining the scope of anti-L.G.B.T. violence.

## The Consequences of Selling Arms to Saudi Arabia

On Aug. 9, a laser-guided bomb hit a school bus in Yemen, killing dozens of children; some of the victims' bodies were so mutilated they could not be identified. A week later, CNN reported that the 500-pound weapon had been sold to Saudi Arabia by Lockheed Martin. In 2016 a similar strike killed 155 people at a funeral hall in Yemen, and a U.S.-made bomb killed 97 people at a Yemeni market, two events that prompted the Obama

# America Media

	A JESUIT MINISTRY
President and Editor in Chief Executive Editors Editor at Large Production Editor Senior Editors Creative Director Graphic Designer Poetry Editor	Kevin Clarke James T. Keane J.D. Long-García Edward W. Schmidt, S.J. Shawn Tripoli
Vatican Correspondent National Correspondent Associate Editors	Gerard O'Connell Michael J. O'Loughlin Zachary Davis Ashley McKinless Olga Segura Leopold Stuebner, S.J. Robert David Sullivan Eric Sundrup, S.J.
Assistant Editors Editorial Assistant	Joseph McAuley Vivian Cabrera
Producer	
Assistant Producer Contributing Writers	Brendan Busse, S.J. Nichole M. Flores Pascal-Emmanuel Gobry Cecilia González-Andrieu Eileen Markey Jim McDermott, S.J. Kaya Oakes Nathan Schneider Stephanie Slade Eve Tushnet
Contributing Editors	Ellen Boegel Patrick Gilger, S.J. Adam Hincks, S.J. Maryann Cusimano Love Paul McNelis, S.J.
Regional Correspondents	Dean Dettloff (Toronto) Anthony Egan, S.J. (Johannesburg)
Special Contributors	Jan-Albert Hootsen (Mexico City) Jim McDermott, S.J. (Los Angeles) Russell Pollitt, S.J. (Johannesburg) David Stewart, S.J. (London) Verna Yu (Hong Kong) Jake Martin, S.J., Sean Salai, S.J.
Editor, The Jesuit Post Moderator, Catholic Book Club O'Hare Fellows	Daniel N. Gustafson, S.J. Kevin Spinale, S.J. Ciaran Freeman Brandon Sanchez Emma Winters
Summer Intern	Sean Ruse
Executive V.P. & C.O.O. V.P. for Finance and Operations Director of Advertising Services Director of Marketing Director of Advancement Associate Director of Advancement Special Assistant to the President and Editor in Chief	Ted Nadeau Rosa M. Del Saz Kenneth Arko Louis Cassetta Heather Trotta James Cappabianca Nicholas D. Sawicki
Business Operations Staff	Anastasia Buraminskaya, Glenda Castro, Karina Clark, Sean Connelly, Ana Nuñez,
Editors Emeriti Chair, Board of Directors	Elena Te Raymond A. Schroth, S.J. Francis W. Turnbull, S.J. Susan S. Braddock
americamagazine.org facebook.com/americamag twitter.com/americamag	1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Fl. New York, NY 10036 America Press Inc. d/b/a America Media ©2018

administration to ban U.S. companies from selling precision-guided military technology to the Saudis. The ban did not last long: It was lifted in March 2017 by then-Secretary of State Rex Tillerson.

The previous administration got it right. The United States has no immediate security interests in the military campaign, led by the Saudis and backed by the Yemeni government, against the Iran-backed Houthi rebels in Yemen. The conflict has led to thousands of civilian deaths, caused famine conditions and produced a cholera outbreak. Last month, Kareem Fahim of The Washington Post reported that the civilian death toll in Yemen could now be as high as 50,000.

The United States must bear responsibility for exacerbating what a U.N. fact-finding team has called "the world's largest humanitarian crisis." The U.S. government has provided the Saudi-led air campaign with mid-air refueling and military advice, but the billions of dollars in arms sales to the Saudi-led coalition has had the most serious consequences. Fortunately, U.S. policy may be changing. Secretary of State Mike Pompeo has reportedly discussed the need to investigate the air strike on the school bus with a Saudi prince, and last month President Trump signed a defense spending bill calling on the State Department to certify that Saudi Arabia is making a genuine effort to reduce civilian casualties.

Attention to the role of advanced weaponry bought from U.S. companies must intensify, and these arms sales must be curtailed if the Saudis cannot bring their military operations in Yemen under control. ads@americamedia.org 212515.0126 General Inquiries 212-581-4640 Subscriptions and Additional Copies 1800.627.9533 Reprints reprints@americamedia.org Editorial Email america@americamedia.org

## Don't blame the sex abuse crisis on queer Catholics

This is not a fun moment to be Catholic, and we are all grasping for sense and answers. But using the sexual abuse and accountability scandal to scapegoat Catholic queerness is not O.K.

Take, for example, the public statement of Aug. 18 from Bishop Robert Morlino of Madison, Wis. I trust the bishop has the best intentions, but some of his most scorching indignation is aimed not at the abuses of power he is supposed to be talking about, but at homosexuality, which he reminds us the church regards as "intrinsically disordered" and which "cries out to heaven for vengeance." Whatever theological truth may lurk in these words is about as pastorally presented as if I were to nail Acts 2:44 to the door of a bishop's mansion. There are other concurrent truths.

Meanwhile, our friends (and I do regard them as friends) at First Things know the classiest way to discriminate is to find a member of the group in question to assent to discrimination. In an essay for that journal, Daniel Mattson, who identifies as a man with "deep-seated homosexual tendencies," contends that "men like me" should be systematically excluded from the priesthood.

Each time I read something like this, I think of how the people who have saved my faith when it was on the brink happened to be queer folks. I expect it was their experience of marginalization and their humanness against it that helped me see where God is. Some of these people have been of the left, some of the right. Sometimes things have even gotten inappropriate. But that was not because they were queer. Straight folks in the church cross boundaries, too, just as much.

I came into this church in the heat of The Boston Globe revelations about sexual abuse nearly two decades ago. I was baptized in 2003, when I was 18, and I was old enough to know the difference between the nonsense and the glory. I would not have begun to know God were it not for a person, harbored in holy orders, whose life could only be described as queer, and who drew me in, safely and respectfully, when the straight dudes wanted to drive me out. I never noticed queerness in another one of the people I looked to early in my Christian life as a guide and model. But vears later I ran into him with his partner at a famously welcoming Mass, on the other end of town from where he lived.

In years when nothing made sense and the hypocrisy got overwhelming, the testimonies of people whose gender experience most of the world did not bother to understand showed me how tiny my quibbles were in God's eyes.

And it was from some corners of this church, believe it or not, that queer experiences seemed to make the most sense. From one corner, a nun who had to keep her ministry to the trans community secret but who shared with me some of the inspiring, horrifying stories of the people she served. From another, the sweet friendship between a famous Jesuit and a woman whose husband they had tended to decades earlier while he was dying from AIDS.

I am not calling the church to some crass conformity. I do not think mainstream, progressive, affirming culture has queerness all sorted out. We still need ancient wisdom. But the universal church will not be any use if it is driving underground all kinds of queer experience. We need to be present with that experience if we are to learn from it, to enlarge our pitiful grasp of God.

When Pope Francis talks about a pastoral approach to these matters, some think it is a slippery slope to heresy, and some think it is mere talk. But no: Accompaniment is the only way we can learn what God is trying to tell us. To hold the challenge in our midst. To confront it and to embrace it.

In a sense, there is some truth that the problem of sexual abuse has to do with a problem of queer sexuality. It is a problem of repressed, denialist, immature abuses of power that take root when the fullness, and queerness, of human sexuality is not speakable or honored.

There is a revelation at hand here. It is not a liberal revelation or a conservative one. It is something else, something ancient. Blindness to it has caused so much pain. It has caused good people and good leaders to be their worst selves. We need more penitence and healing. But we also need the courage to confront evil with love, to confront ignorance with the willingness to learn and to embrace.

Nathan Schneider, a contributing writer for **America**, is a reporter and professor of media studies at the University of Colorado, Boulder. Twitter: @ntnsndr. This essay was adapted from a series of tweets.



**IS PLEASED TO ANNOUNCE** 



# Veerabhadran Ramanathan, PhD

Distinguished Professor of Atmospheric and Climate Sciences at the Scripps Institution of Oceanography, University of California, San Diego

# THE FORTY-EIGHTH RECIPIENT OF THE MENDEL MEDAL



The Mendel Medal is awarded to outstanding scientists who have done much by their painstaking work to advance the cause of science, and, by their lives and their standing before the world as scientists, have demonstrated that between true science and true religion there is no intrinsic conflict.

Dr. Ramanathan will deliver the 2018 Mendel Medal lecture

### "CLIMATE CHANGE: SCIENTIFIC BASIS AND SOLUTIONS TO BEND THE CURVE"

FRIDAY, November 16, 2018 • 2 p.m. Villanova University • Villanova Room, Connelly Center

Villanova University: Founded by the Augustinians in 1842 villanova.edu/mendelmedal

#### PAST MENDEL MEDAL RECIPIENTS

Dr. Francis S. Collins Director, National Center for Human Genome Research

Dr. George V. Coyne, SJ Director Emeritus, Vatican Observatory

Dr. Michael E. DeBakey Chancellor Emeritus, Baylor College of Medicine

Dr. Petrus J.W. Debye Nobel Laureate in Chemistry

**Rev. P. Teilhard de Chardin, SJ** Paleontologist, National Geological Survey of China

Dr. Peter C. Doherty Nobel Laureate in Medicine, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital

Dr. Paul Farmer Medical Anthropologist, Harvard Medical School

Dr. Anthony S. Fauci Director, National Institute of Allergy & Infectious Diseases, National Institute of Health

Dr. Sylvester J. Gates Physics, University of Maryland

Dr. Ralph Hirschmann Bioorganic Chemistry, University of Pennsylvania

Dr. Brian K. Kobilka Nobel Laureate in Chemistry, Stanford University School of Medicine

Dr. W. Ian Lipkin Director, Center for Infection and Immunity, Columbia University

Dr. Victor A. McKusick Founder, Human Genome Organization, The Johns Hopkins University

Dr. Olufunmilayo Olopade Global Health Director, Center for Clinical Cancer Genetics

Dr. Ruth Patrick Limnology, Academy of Natural Sciences

Dr. Peter Raven Director, Missouri Botanical Garden

Dr. Holmes Rolston, III Philosophy, Colorado State University

Dr. Janet Rowley Human Genetics, University of Chicago

Dr. Philip A. Sharp Nobel Laureate in Medicine, MIT

Dr. Maxine F. Singer President, Carnegie Institution of Washington

Dr. Charles H. Townes Nobel Laureate in Physics, University of California, Berkeley

Dr. Robert G. Webster Virology, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital

Dr. Ahmed H. Zewail Nobel Laureate for developments in femtoscience, Chemistry, Cal Tech

# Viganò 'testimony' on McCarrick scandal shocks U.S. church

By Michael J. O'Loughlin

Broad accusations issued by Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò in what he calls a testimony roiled the Catholic Church in August, but Pope Francis is approaching the situation calmly, the Vatican secretary of state said in an interview posted on Aug. 30 by Vatican Insider. Cardinal Pietro Parolin said that in situations like the current crisis, which "obviously creates so much bitterness and worry," the pope "has the ability to take a very serene approach."

"I was with him during the trip to Ireland and after—he seems serene," Cardinal Parolin said.

If so, he may be the only one.

In an unprecedented break with Vatican protocol, Archbishop Viganò, a former Vatican ambassador to the United States, criticized and implicated Catholic church leaders across the United States and all the way to the top in Rome over the handling of former-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick. Archbishop Viganò alleges that the Vatican was made aware of allegations of sexual misconduct by then-Archbishop McCarrick as early as 2000.

Archbishop Viganò says that high-ranking church officials ignored his counsel that then-Cardinal McCarrick should be removed from ministry until 2009 or 2010, when, he alleges, Pope Benedict XVI sanctioned the cardinal. Archbishop Viganò further alleges that Pope Francis reversed those sanctions. He urged Francis to accept responsibility now for the apparent cover-up by resigning. Prominent Catholic commentators, many of whom have long been critical of the pope, have seized on Archbishop Viganò's explosive testimony and urged the same, joined by U.S. Cardinal Raymond Burke, a frequent antagonist of Pope Francis.

Archbishop Viganò alleges that Cardinal Donald Wuerl is lying when he says he did not know about the alleged offenses by his predecessor as archbishop of Washington, D.C. The letter also alleges that former-Cardinal McCarrick played "kingmaker" under Francis, responsible for the appointments of Cardinal Blase Cupich to the Archdiocese of Chicago, Cardinal Joseph Tobin to the Archdiocese of Newark and Bishop Robert McElroy to the Diocese of San Diego. The archbishop warns of a "homosexual network" in the church, which he blames for the church's continued sexual abuse crisis. Archbishop Viganò says that all his allegations can be confirmed by memos and files kept at the nunciature, the Vatican's embassy, in Washington.

Some Catholics have expressed skepticism about the charges in the letter and the archbishop's motives. Archbishop Viganò has his own checkered history when it comes to sexual abuse in the church, particularly in his handling of abuse and harassment allegations against Archbishop John Nienstedt, the former head of the Archdiocese of Minneapolis-St. Paul. Archbishop Viganò recently defended his actions during that investigation.

And one of the central claims of the letter, that Pope Benedict placed secret sanctions on Cardinal McCarrick, is being questioned. Cardinal McCarrick continued to keep an active public schedule during Benedict's pontificate, attending many national events, preaching publicly and even meeting with world leaders and testifying before Congress during the timeframe in question. Cardinal McCarrick even met with Pope Benedict and Archbishop Viganò at several events.

His claim that then-Cardinal McCarrick acted as "kingmaker" may also be overblown. David Gibson, director of Fordham's Center on Religion and Culture, who formerly covered the Vatican as a journalist, told **America** that this allegation seemed to be "highly exaggerated because it serves Viganò's purposes" but noted that it may also reflect "McCarrick's sense of his own influence and importance."

Three of the central characters in the report—Pope Francis, Emeritus Pope Benedict XVI and Archbishop McCarrick—have not weighed in on the specific charges. Archbishop McCarrick, accepting the Holy See's demand that he withdraw from public life, has declined repeated requests for comment.

Cardinal Daniel DiNardo of Galveston-Houston, president of the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops, has requested an audience with Pope Francis to discuss the controversy and urged the Vatican to launch a complete investigation. Cardinal DiNardo said on Aug. 27: "The questions raised [by Archbishop Viganò] deserve answers that are conclusive and based on evidence. Without those answers, innocent men may be tainted by false accusation and the guilty may be left to repeat sins of the past."

Members of the U.S. hierarchy named by Archbishop Viganò quickly responded to his accusations. On Aug. 27, the Archdiocese of Washington reported in a statement that "Archbishop Viganò at no time provided Cardinal Wuerl any information about an alleged document from Pope Benedict XVI with directives of any sort from Rome regarding Archbishop McCarrick."

The statement adds, "Perhaps the starting point for a

serene and objective review of this testimony is the inclusion of Archbishop Viganò's tenure as Apostolic Nuncio to the United States in the mandate of the Apostolic Visitation" called for by Cardinal DiNardo.

Cardinal Cupich released a statement calling the letter "astonishing," pointing out inaccuracies and urging a "thorough vetting" of its claims.

Cardinal Tobin discounted the allegations in the letter, saying in a statement on Aug. 27 that they "cannot be understood as contributing to the healing of survivors of sexual abuse."

Bishop McElroy, accused by the archbishop of ignoring reports of Archbishop McCarrick's offenses in 2016, issued a remarkably blunt refutation. "In its ideologically-driven selection of bishops who are attacked," he said, "in its clear efforts to settle old personal scores, in its omission of any reference to Archbishop Viganò's own massive personal participation in the covering up of sexual abuse by bishops, and most profoundly in its hatred for Pope Francis and all that he has taught, Archbishop Viganò consistently subordinates the pursuit of comprehensive truth to partisanship, division and distortion."

But a series of statements from other Catholic bishops, including Archbishop Charles Chaput of Philadelphia and Archbishop Salvatore Cordileone of San Francisco, expressed confidence in the integrity of Archbishop Viganò and urged a thorough investigation of his allegations.

Meanwhile survivors of abuse and victim advocates worry that the entire internecine spectacle provoked by the archbishop's allegations will prove a crippling distraction from reform efforts that might bring to an end the church's ongoing agony over clerical abuses. Peter Isely, a survivor of abuse, told The New York Times that the letter appears more about church politics than addressing abuse. "This is infighting between curia factions that are exploiting the abuse crisis and victims of clergy sexual abuse as leverage in the struggle for church power," he said. "The sexual abuse crisis is not about whether a bishop is a liberal or a conservative. It is about protecting children."

Michael J. O'Loughlin, national correspondent. Twitter: @MikeOLoughlin. With CNS and staff reporting.

# Is the worst behind us? Study records continuing decline in abuse reports

The bad news on the church's sexual abuse crisis seems endless, but a Catholic researcher finds cause for hope in a continuing decline in the number of contemporary cases being recorded. Mark Gray, a researcher at the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, recently reported in the blog "1964" that alleged sexual abuse of minors by clergy in the United States seems to have been highest in the early 1970s, with a significant fall afterward. The data can change, but Mr. Gray reports that the peak years of reported incidents are the same as when the revelations of abuse began in the Boston area in 2002. (In other words, the time distribution has not moved forward.)

To produce the chart below, CARA analyzed 8,694 allegations of sexual abuse made between 2004 and 2017. The results are similar to those of a study of the sexual abuse crisis by researchers at the John Jay College of Criminal Justice in 2004.

The CARA data does not include the recent report by a grand jury in Pennsylvania, but most of the incidents of sexual abuse in that report occurred before the early 2000s. Mr. Gray notes that the priests accused of abuse in the Pennsylvania report, on average, were born in 1933 and ordained in 1961. (Former cardinal Theodore McCarrick was born in 1930 and ordained in 1958.) Similarly, the John Jay report found that of the accused abusers in that study, "the majority...were born between 1920 and 1950" and that the most common decade of ordination was the 1960s.

Mr. Gray notes that many Catholics remain unaware that "abuse cases were more common before 1985 than since." He writes: "The fact that any abuse occurred at all, regardless of when, is horrifying.... Yet, this detail is important in understanding the causes of the scandal, what legal actions are possible, and the steps that can be taken to prevent any future abuse."

Robert David Sullivan, associate editor. Twitter: @RobertDSullivan.



Source: "Pain Never Disappears from Unhealed Wounds," Aug. 28, 2018, on the blog "1968," published by the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, Washington, D.C.

# A National Town Hall on Latinos and Catholic Education in the United States

Convening leaders in education, Latino affairs, the Catholic Church, and social and pastoral ministries to discuss the future of the Church in the United States.

# 5 p.m. October 30, 2018 RSVP: events@americamedia.org

The Catholic University of America Heritage Hall in Father O'Connell Hall 620 Michigan Ave., N.E. Washington, DC 20064

#### Welcome:

**John Garvey, J.D.** President The Catholic University of America

#### Introductions: Matt Malone, S.J. Editor in Chief *America* magazine



Moderator **Hosffman Ospino, Ph.D.** Boston College



The Most Rev. Oscar Cantú Coadjutor Bishop of San Jose



**Thomas Burnford, D.Min.** President, National Catholic Educational Association



**Veronica Alonzo, Ed.D.** Associate Superintendent of Operations, Dallas Catholic Schools



**Monsignor Michael Clay, D.Min.** Director, Pastoral Ministry Program The Catholic University of America

To request accommodations for individuals with disabilities, call 202-319-5211







Colombia's Catatumbo region is home to some of the most intensive coca production in the world. Life here has revolved around the crop, and the violence that comes with it, for decades.

But now, in the rural community of Las Palmas, a group of former coca farmers has rejected their old cash crop. With the assistance of Jesuit Refugee Service and the Diocese of Tibú, 41 families in Las Palmas are replacing coca production with legitimate crops in the hope of promoting peace.

The Havana Accords led to the demobilization of the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia (known by its Spanish acronym, FARC), the largest of the country's leftist guerrilla groups. But despite the high hopes generated by the accord, peace has never truly arrived.

As one woman who was forced to flee in May 2018 puts it: "The peace is a lie; Catatumbo is as bad today as it was 10 years ago. Since the FARC left, there has been a lot of killing. And of course, the FARC continues, only by other names."

Today, rival leftist groups and former FARC units whose members have denounced the peace accords continue to fight. The result has been that the government has struggled to establish its authority or provide social services in Catatumbo.

The 2016 peace accords were intended to change all that. In addition to demobilizing the FARC, the accords were meant to offer a way out of coca production for farmers who long depended on it. Farmers were to clear their fields of coca plants. The government was to help them plant legitimate crops and provide subsidies until they became able to support themselves. Trusting the government's promise, the Las Palmas families signed on to the deal. They voluntarily destroyed their coca fields, their primary source of income. But almost a year later, the families are still waiting for government assistance.

Preparing a field for planting in Palmas, Colombia

Alex, a signatory to the 2015 Havana accords who asked to be identified by his first name only, voluntarily cleared his fields of coca. Now he feels betrayed: "We've seen the conflicts because of the drug. We've seen many families killed that were working with the drugs."

Jesuit Refugee Service and the Diocese of Tibú are trying to accompany the farmers in their efforts to transition from coca. After decades of relying on the cultivation of the coca plant, farmers have lost much agricultural know-how about other crops.

José Luis Duarte, the technical assessor of Jesuit Refugee Service's project for rural youth, says the goal is to "generate, or regenerate, an identity as farmers." With the farmers who grow coca continuing to live well day-to-day, the pressure on the farmers who have chosen to leave coca cultivation behind is immense.

"We want to change. But no one bets on changes," said Alex. "How can we make it so our 41 families are not forced to return to planting coca? That would be the most shameful thing, to have to return to planting coca to survive."

Antonio De Loera-Brust, former O'Hare fellow at America Media. Twitter: @AntonioDeLoeraB.

Visit americamagazine.org to see a video report on this program.

# **Corcoran** Visiting Chair in Christian-Jewish Relations



Boston College and its Center for Christian-Jewish Learning invite applications for a one-year visiting appointment (renewable for a second year) as the 2019-2020 Corcoran Visiting Chair in Christian-Jewish Relations, specializing in some aspect of the relationship between Christianity and Judaism. Candidates must hold a Ph.D. or its earned equivalent, have published in the field, and hold (or have retired from) a tenured position (or its equivalent) in a university or seminary. Applications from all relevant disciplines are welcome. The Corcoran Chair will agree to take on specific responsibilities related to the mission of the Center.

The full description is available at www.bc.edu/cjl. A list of previous Chairs, and their conferences and courses during their tenures, is also available online. Electronic submission of the following are requested: letter of application, C.V., and a proposal for the research and writing to be done while holding the Chair, including an indication of how these fit into the guidelines above. Two letters of recommendation should be submitted directly. Applications are due by Nov. 16, 2018. Decisions will be made by Feb. 15, 2019. Communications should be addressed to Prof. James Bernauer, S.J. (cjlearning@bc.edu), Director, Center for Christian-Jewish Learning, Stokes Hall N405, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02467 USA.

# Let us help you serve the Church and the World.

SCHOLARSHIP ASSISTANCE AVAILABLE. APPLY TODAY.

At CTU, we are impelled by the messagge of Jesus Christ to be a transformative force in the Church and world for affirming human dignity and the sacredness of God's creation.

Join our community of scholars, lay and religious men and women committed to witnesing to Christ's good news of justice, love, and peace. Begin your application online at: *ctu.edu/admissions* 



## ctu.edu

5401 South Cornell Avenue Chicago, Illinois 60615

THEOLOGY AND MINISTRY Celebrating Fifty Years | 1968 - 2018

A GRADUATE SCHOOL OF

# Can there be #Justice4Berta?

The first trial related to the murder in Honduras of the environmental activist Berta Cáceres in 2016 is scheduled to begin on Sept. 10, but prosecutors admitted only a few weeks ago that they had not analyzed key evidence seized during multiple arrests months after the crime. Because of the attention focused on the murder of Ms. Cáceres, a world-renowned leader of the indigenous Lenca people, there is concern that if impunity persists in this case, there may be further violence against human rights leaders in Honduras.

Before her assassination, Ms. Cáceres received numerous threats because of her efforts to stop a hydroelectric dam project, Agua Zarca, from being built on the Gualcarque River, which is considered sacred to the Lencas. The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights had urged Honduran security to protect Ms. Cáceres, but she was shot and killed in her home on March 2.

Two members of the organization co-founded by Ms. Cáceres, the Civic Council of Popular Indigenous Organizations (Copinh), have been killed and others reported assassination attempts in the months after Ms. Cáceres's murder. Other Copinh members have reported harassment by Honduran authorities.

Bertha Zúñiga, the daughter of Ms. Cáceres and now

Copinh's general coordinator, was the target of a machete attack in July 2017. "We've been in an intense fight for justice for more than two years," said Ms. Zúñiga at a press conference in Guatemala City on Aug. 21. "The criminal structure that ordered her murder must be uncovered."

Ms. Zúñiga reiterated a demand for the "intellectual authors" of the crime to be investigated, naming the powerful Atala Zablah family in Honduras, which stepped in as a major financier for the dam project in 2011. Though the upcoming trial will explore the circumstances leading up to Ms. Cáceres's murder, it will be difficult to show the link between who ordered the killing and who carried it out without evidence obtained from cellphones and computers that prosecutors have in their possession.

In May 2016 four men were arrested and charged with Ms. Cáceres's murder by Honduran police, and between May 2016 and February 2017, four additional men were arrested for the crime. During the arrests in 2016, Honduran authorities seized evidence from the homes of the accused, including computers, flash drives, cellphones and cameras, as well as cartridge shells and a Colt revolver. Police carried out a search of the offices of the DESA Corp., the original sponsors of the project, in Tegucigalpa, where they confiscated USB drives, computers, tablets and paper documentation.



The legal team representing the Cáceres family has requested a review of the evidence in the possession of state prosecutors more than 35 times in the past two years.

At a hearing on Aug. 23, Attorney General Oscar Chinchilla's office confirmed the worst: Although material related to the crime had been in the office's possession for more than two years, most of the evidence had not undergone any kind of analysis—and some of it had not even been extracted from digital devices. "The negligent attitude of the public prosecutor's office has been obvious," Rodil Vasquez, one of the lawyers who represents Ms. Cáceres's family, told **America**.

The court ordered prosecutors to provide an analysis of this evidence to the family by Aug. 29, giving them only two days to examine it before a scheduled evidentiary hearing.

In an open letter dated Aug. 23, international and national human rights groups asked Mr. Chinchilla to fulfill his obligations as attorney general, objecting to "irregularities" in the case that could lead to its dismissal.



A migrant, center, receives aid just after disembarking from the Italian Coast Guard ship Diciotti in the port of Catania, Italy, on Aug. 26.

# Italian church steps in for stranded migrants

Italy's Catholic bishops have offered to care for a majority of the 140 migrants the country's government had prevented from leaving an Italian Coast Guard ship that was docked for days in a Sicilian harbor. Politics should not be practiced at the expense of the poor, these prominent churchmen said on Aug. 26.

Cardinal Gualtiero Bassetti, president of the Italian bishops' conference, told Italian state TV that the bishops worked with Italy's Interior Ministry "in a spirit of collaboration" to help end the stalemate over where the asylum seekers rescued by the coast guard ship would go.

Italian parishes will care for 100 migrants, while Albania and Ireland will accept about 20 each under an arrangement announced on Aug. 25 by Premier Giuseppe Conte of Italy.

The ship rescued 190 migrants at sea on Aug. 16, most of them young men fleeing harsh rule in Eritrea, and docked in Catania four days later. Italy's anti-migrant Interior Minister Matteo Salvini refused to let passengers who were not minors or ill off the ship until fellow European Union nations volunteered to take the asylum seekers.

Except for Ireland, none did so. Albania is not an E.U. member, and Cardinal Bassetti expressed appreciation to leaders there and in Ireland, which Pope Francis had been visiting for the World Meeting of Families. Francis has used his papacy to stress the need for society to care for migrants and others in need.

Cardinal Bassetti urged more "involvement by Europe, but also by the whole world" in addressing the needs of migrants and refugees. Another bishops' conference official, the Rev. Ivan Maffeis, said that the Italian churchmen became involved because "you can't do politics on the backs of the poor."

Frances D'Emilio, Associated Press.

Jackie McVicar contributes from Central America. Twitter: @pajarolindo.

# A SURVIVOR'S STORY

Danny was in eighth grade when he was abused by a priest. His life was never the same again.

By Joseph J. Guido



When I first met Danny, he had not seen the inside of a Catholic church in two decades, nor had he spoken with a Catholic priest during that time. We met in a coffee shop— "neutral turf," as he called it—and settled into a booth, where we talked for the better part of two hours.

Danny said that he wanted to speak to a priest about what had happened to him as a child, and that his attorney and therapist were supportive of the idea. He also hoped that doing so would put an end to a long, sad and painful struggle with the Catholic Church. He had only two conditions. First, he wanted me to record our conversation to be sure that I "got it right." Second, he asked for a promise that I would someday write about what he told me, so that it might prove helpful to someone else. In telling Danny's story here, as I have done elsewhere, I hope I am being true to that promise.

Danny was in eighth grade when he was sexually abused. Tall for his age and athletic, he was also smart, pious and dutiful. When Sister told him that Father wanted to see him, he left class and walked across the courtyard to the rectory, rang the bell and was ushered into a parlor where Father was pacing back and forth.

"Thanks for coming, son," Father said as he closed the door to the parlor. "There are several things that I would like to talk with you about." He began talking about high school, the importance of studying hard and thinking about his future, and the distraction that girls could pose. All the while he paced back and forth while Danny stood still. With each pass in front of Danny, Father would grope the boy's genitals or buttocks and then move on, talking all the while. After a few minutes, Father stopped pacing and unzipped his pants, masturbated in front of Danny, and then dismissed him. Danny returned to class frightened, bewildered and ashamed.

It happened two more times, once in the church and another time in the sacristy after Mass, and it was the same: unexpected, accompanied by banal patter and then nothing—no explanation, no apology and never a reference to what had taken place. Danny did not tell anyone at the time, shame having gotten the better of him. He also was confused. He knew that what had taken place was lewd and wrong and that he wanted no part of it, but he could not understand why Father, who was otherwise warm and affable and popular with his parishioners, would do such a thing. In high school and college, Danny drifted away from church and eventually stopped going altogether. He worked hard, received good grades, got a good job when he graduated and steadily advanced in his company. He also started running. Day after day, he would run mile upon mile, and when he could not sleep or when a nightmare would wake him, he would go running in the middle of the night. Running was a comfort, a distraction and, as he knew even then, a metaphor. If he could, he would gladly run away from the memories.

Danny's wife was a good, strong woman and urged him to get therapy and to sue the church. He did, and as a result received a considerable settlement. But she could not quite understand why Danny wanted to speak with a priest. As she put it: "What good can come of it? Why open old wounds?"

But Danny insisted. Once a pious and dutiful eighth grader, he had become a morally determined man, the arc of continuity between the boy and the man bearing witness both to his own probity and to that shared moral sensibility that marks us at our best. For him it was a matter of "helping others," without which he would feel incomplete and somehow complicit.

"No one should have to go through what I did. Tell them," he urged me, "what he took away from me. Not just my innocence but my faith. I'm like a spiritual orphan, betrayed by what I loved, and I feel lost and alone."

#### The Present Crisis

The release of the grand jury's report in Pennsylvania detailing decades of sexual abuse of minors by hundreds of Catholic priests and the separate allegations of sexual abuse and harassment of seminarians made against former Cardinal Theodore McCarrick have roiled the church in ways not seen since the "long Lent" in Boston in 2002. The sheer scale of the findings and allegations have been bracing, if not shocking; and understandably they have given rise to a sense of betrayal and outrage, demands for justice and rectification, and an impetus to assign blame and find a remedy.

Compounding these feelings are the recent allegations by Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò, a former apostolic nuncio to the United States, that then-Archbishop McCarrick's actions were widely known and duly reported to Vatican officials, including Popes Benedict and Francis—who, he alleges, either failed to act on what they knew or did so but were stymied by the inaction of others.

# RUNNING WAS A COMFORT, A DISTRACTION AND, AS DANNY KNEW EVEN THEN, A METAPHOR. IF HE COULD, HE WOULD GLADLY RUN AWAY FROM THE MEMORIES.

To say that this constitutes a crisis for the church in this country is to put it mildly. And as is true in any crisis, the demands of the moment, important though they are, can distract us from ongoing commitments, unduly narrow our focus and cause us to neglect important subtleties and distinctions that in less febrile states we are better able to attend to.

Danny's story serves as a cautionary tale and a needed tonic. He was abused neither in Boston nor in Pennsylvania, and he came forward on his own, for his own reasons and in his own time; no public crisis occasioned or accompanied his self-disclosure. In this sense, his story is ordinary (if such a term can be used in this context)—one of thousands that survivors might tell, each of them personal and thus different, and yet each in its own way contributing to our understanding of abuse and informing our response. Indeed, attending to survivors like Danny may take us closer to the day when, pray God, no one else will have to go through what he did.

#### A Primer on Sexual Abuse

Though it has been said many times, it never ceases to bear repeating. Far from being novel or exceptional, the sexual abuse of children and adolescents is common, widespread and perennial. It is taking place today, as it did yesterday and will tomorrow. Research suggests that one in five females and as many as one in 10 males report having been sexually abused or assaulted before age 18.

Sexual abuse is most commonly perpetrated by someone close to the child, most often a male, and while it spares no particular kind of family or institution, it is more likely to arise in situations that are in some way sequestered, unsupervised and privileged. The privilege may be owed to the imbalance of power between an adult and a child or adolescent, especially when the adult has been lent an aura of distinction—as a priest, coach or teacher, for example and the young person is dependent and without an alternative recourse. It might also be owed to particular family dynamics that go unquestioned, to an institutional culture that prizes secrecy and loyalty above transparency and accountability, or to cultural and religious beliefs that implicitly tolerate the abuse of women and children.

Danny's experience mirrors that of many others in these regards. "Father" was a revered and much loved figure, and one who had unfettered access to Danny in contexts that gave him relative license to do whatever he wanted to do. Moreover, and as we have been forced to acknowledge of late, Father was part of a clerical culture that, if it did not convey impunity, would likely have mitigated the consequences of his behavior had it become known.

Important though these conditions are, they do not in themselves supply the motive for abuse. That motive rather proceeds from the bent and warp of an abuser's mind. The range and nature of such mental aberrations are broad but can include various psychopathologies, a disordered personality, the secondary effects of substance abuse, significant emotional immaturity and a personal history of unresolved trauma, including sexual trauma.

It is tempting to assume otherwise, but the disposition to sexually abuse a minor is not owed to one's gender (though most abusers are male), nor to one's marital status or sexual orientation per se (though priest abusers are ostensibly celibate and the majority of their victims are male). Rather it is the mind of the abuser that drives his sexual behavior in an aberrant direction. Most men do not abuse children or adolescents, nor do most priests or most gay people. This suggests that abusers share something in common that is not specifically owed to being a man, a priest or gay. Something similar might be said about being liberal or conservative, younger or older, pre- or post- Vatican II.

In Danny's story, his pastor exhibited a profound lack of empathy for him, treating him as a mere object and disregarding his wishes, needs and well-being. There is no evidence of passion or desire, nor of any recognizable emotion, but rather an extraordinary emotional vacuity. Moreover, his pastor demonstrates no remorse, no sense of guilt or shame and no evidence of having a conscience, instead proving himself adept at masquerading as warm and affable. It is hard not to see how this disturbing mental set—with its absence of maturity, benevolence or moral compass—informs and directs his behavior over and above what other putative causes may contribute to it.

It must also be said that the sexual abuse of young people is aided and abetted by our tendency to forget it. In her landmark book *Trauma and Recovery*, the psychiatrist Judith Herman noted that sexual abuse, like other forms of trauma, is liable to lead to a peculiar cultural and societal amnesia. Between one cultural crisis involving sexual abuse and another, it is as if we pass through the waters of Lethe and are lulled into complacency. We forget what we once knew—the shock and dismay of Boston in 2002—and the lessons we learned in the past until, in the resurgent shock and dismay of a new crisis, we are forced to learn them again.

Sexual abuse, like all trauma, is difficult for any of us to acknowledge, and understandably so. As T. S. Eliot noted, "human kind cannot bear very much reality." Even Danny was wont to run away from remembering and acknowledging his own experience. But acknowledge and remember it we must, for, as Freud noted, what we do not remember we are prone to re-enact.

That is one reason why the "Charter for the Protection of Children and Young People," also known as the Dallas Charter, is important despite its limitations, and why it might serve as a model for whatever recourse the church employs to hold bishops accountable. It is also why "The Nature and Scope of the Problem of Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Priests and Deacons in the United States," generally referred to as the John Jay Report, is important. Indeed, it would be welcome if the latter was but the first in a series of research reports sponsored by the church with the goal of understanding and preventing sexual abuse. If nothing else, such documents, and the policies and procedures that follow from them, force us to periodically acknowledge a disquieting truth. Optimally, they will prevent us from forgetting, and in doing so, will prevent a re-enactment of the present crisis at some future date.

In many ways, Danny's story suggests that the abuse of minors in the church follows a pattern that can be found in any number of families and institutions; indeed, at this lev-

THE BETRAYAL WAS TWOFOLD: IT WAS NOT ONLY DANNY'S BODY AND MIND THAT FELL VICTIM TO THE ABUSE BUT ALSO HIS VIEW OF THE SACRED. el there is little to distinguish it. This leads us to consider how, if at all, the sexual abuse of a minor by a priest or bishop might be different from abuse in general. The answer to this question may constitute the most important lesson Danny can teach us, for it is evident that Danny lost not only his innocence but also his faith, his sense of the sacred and of sanctuary. To the extent that this is true, we will not have served Danny and others like him well if we offer only care, recompense and protection (important though each of these is) and do not aid in the restoration of the sacred.

#### **Restoring the Sacred**

Danny died some years ago. His obituary described his work, his family and his interests, and the calling hours for his wake. It also noted that his funeral service would be conducted at a local church, but not a Catholic one. He was young, just shy of 50, and although I had heard that he had cancer, I could not help but wonder what toll the childhood abuse had taken on his health. But what was most touching was the fact that he had found his way back to church.

I do not know whether he had been attending regularly or what that meant about his faith, only that church was not the "neutral turf" we had met on—that, and the fact that he would not be alone. Spiritual orphan though he was, he would not pass from this world alone. Family, friends and a congregation would gather around him, sing and pray, bless him and see him safely to his resting place.

I wish I knew what occasioned his return, what combination of circumstances and readiness allowed him to stop running at last. I also wish that he could have made it all the way home. But perhaps that would be asking for too much; after all, that he came back as far as he did is remarkable and could hardly have been foreseen.

Danny's abuser was not just a well-loved and respected figure in the community but a priest, an *alter Christus* ("another Christ") who should have acted *in persona Christi* ("in the person of Christ"). The betrayal therefore was twofold: It was not only Danny's body and mind that fell victim to the abuse but also his view of the sacred. It is no wonder, then, that when he started to run, Danny ran as far as he could from the church. But his death and burial suggest that if he ran from what he once knew of God, he somehow found a new and different way back to him.

In the midst of adversity, we nearly always turn to

what has worked for us in the past, and most times that is enough. We fall on our knees and pray, are comforted and assured, and gather the strength to do what we must. But as the psychologist Kenneth Pargament notes, there are certain times and events in our lives that challenge our ability to rely on the tried and true. These events may tempt us to conclude that our original faith was misplaced—there is no God, or if there is, he does not care—or rather invite us to find God anew and differently, at a greater depth and with a measure of insight and understanding that can sustain hope amid the ruin.

Despite our manifest sins and failures to protect people like Danny, the church, in the mysterious economy of God's grace, can also offer them a sanctuary in which to retrieve a faith that was bruised and battered, if not forfeited, in the wake of another's malice. Indeed, it is the singular grace of the church, brought to its knees and humbled by its sins and prideful folly, to be the all-too-human habitation of that wondrous anamnesis of another victim, stripped naked, abused and abandoned, his innocence violated by another's decree, who rose to new life and in his rising raised all other victims that they may share this new life with him.

Let us not fail in this, nor be distracted from doing this. Let us commit ourselves once again, with a measure of commitment equal to Danny's, to do right by him and others like him. Let us be humble, patient, without presumption, accompanying the Dannys of this world and following their lead for as long as it takes. And when we have atoned in this way for our failures, may we provide them with the keys to a sanctuary in exchange for the sacrilege committed against them. May we provide them with the keys to a holy place, a sacred place, where they can find again, newly, deeply, the One who became a victim so that they could share in his victory.

Joseph J. Guido, O.P., is the senior staff psychologist in the Personal Counseling Center and an assistant professor of psychology at Providence College in Providence, R.I.

# AN UNLIKELY ALLIANCE What can nuns and 'nones' learn from one another?

#### By Kaya Oakes

Late in November 2016, people from all over the country gathered in Cambridge, Mass., for an experimental meeting in an austere room at Harvard Divinity School. It was deeply cold outside, and just weeks after the election, many of the participants were feeling shaken.

Around the table where they had gathered were two demographic groups that rarely encounter each other: millennials who describe themselves as having no single religious practice (better known as "nones"); and Catholic women religious, who mostly prefer to be called sisters but will settle for being called nuns.

They had gathered to share experiences of community, spirituality and activism. More quickly than anyone had anticipated, they discovered enough common ground to lead one of the sisters to tell the millennials, "I believe that we are more alike than we are different."

Although the number of nones is growing, making up nearly 25 percent of the population, according to the Pew Research Center, they are far from apathetic about what religion can offer, and many are self-described spiritual seekers. At the same time, according to the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, the number of sisters is shrinking and aging, with fewer than 50,000 sisters alive today, and nearly 90 percent of those sisters are over the age of 60. But women religious are often the first to tell you that they aren't experiencing a narrative of decline, because they still have millennia of wisdom and experience to share.

The Nuns and Nones project seeks to bring these two groups together in order to explore new forms of community life, help millennials see models for sustainable activism and create an intergenerational network of connections, what the project's website describes



"I believe we are more alike than we are different," said one sister at the Nun and Nones gathering at Harvard University in 2016. From left to right, Adam Horowitz, Judy Carle, R.S.M., Mary Trainer, R.S.M., and Rachel Plattus. Photos from the meeting are from Rhino Media.

Υ.

as "an unlikely alliance across communities of spirit." Different people emphasized different turning points in the origin of the project, but the sisters and millennials I interviewed all agreed: It began with a gathering, a circle, and it began with conversation.

The Harvard Nuns and Nones gatherings were sponsored by How We Gather, a project led by Casper ter Kuile and Angie Thurston, two postgraduate fellows at Harvard Divinity School. How We Gather explores how millennials are building communities of meaning outside of institutional religious structures.

They were organized by the Rev. Wayne Muller, who is in his mid-60s and was ordained in the United Church of Christ, and Adam Horowitz, 31, who grew up in a secular Jewish family and now runs a nonprofit called the U.S. Department of Arts and Culture.

The two met at a retreat run by Mr. Muller, who in 2000 wrote a book about the sabbath that has the distinction of being blurbed by both Henri Nouwen and Mr. Rogers. Mr. Horowitz then realized he and Mr. Muller are neighbors in Santa Fe. They began taking long walks, "just bringing our questions and curiosities." This model of intergenerational and interdenominational conversation and resource sharing was the catalyst for the Nones and Nuns project.

At some point in these conversations, Mr. Muller, who worked with Maryknoll brothers and sisters in the 1980s and with Henri Nouwen, mentioned that he had connections with Catholic sisters. Mr. Horowitz, who has spent time exploring spiritual questions with a group called Open Masters, also realized that the age and experience of the sisters Mr. Muller knew might lead to an interesting conversation, and thus the first Nuns and Nones meeting at Harvard was born.

At their first gathering, Mr. Muller heard the same question over and over from the millennial participants: "How do I meet the nuns near me?" And Mr. Muller says one of the sisters asked of the millennials, "Are there like more of you?" At which point, he added, the whole room burst out laughing.

#### SHARED ACTIVISM

In the year and a half since the first Nuns and Nones gathering, the growing level of interest in these meetings among both sister communities and millennials has led Mr. Horowitz and Mr. Muller and a team of volunteers to stage regular regional gatherings across the country. One of the longest-lasting of these has been in Grand Rapids, Mich. Grand Rapids is home to a large number of Reformed Christian churches, as well as Calvin College, which holds the biannual Festival of Faith and Writing, which itself attracts a large number of spiritual seekers. But Grand Rapids is also home to a community of Dominican Sisters.

Last year, Barbara Hansen, O.P., who is in her early 80s, found herself in conversation about hosting a Nuns and Nones gathering with Katie Gordon, who is in her late 20s. She was then a local interfaith organizer and journalist and is now a student at Harvard Divinity School.

On Palm Sunday in 2017, about 20 nones gathered at the retreat center of the Grand Rapids Dominican sisters, and, according to Ms. Gordon, "It was just like magic."

"That one-to-one conversation left us all totally inspired and speechless about the potential of that group. And so we decided to keep meeting every other week for an hour and a half to just see where the conversation went," said Ms. Gordon.

That group, which is evenly balanced between sisters and millennials—now going under the name of Sisters and Seekers—has been meeting regularly ever since, to see what they can learn from one another about activism, faith and community life.

At the end of each meeting, the group talks about what they would like to discuss at their next meeting, and an email is put together for the next event with the topic and some suggested readings. Sister Hansen says many of the millennials get a lot of their spirituality from Krista Tippett, host of the popular podcast "On Being," and her guests, and they have recently read and discussed "On Being" episodes along with essays on race and law by the Berkeley law professor john a. powell (who spells his name lowercase), and essays on L.G.B.T. Catholics by James Martin, S.J.

Sister Hansen mentioned that one of the challenges in these discussions was a need to develop some guidelines, since conversations that are both cross-generational and between women religious and nonreligious adults have layers of challenges. For example, the sisters do not share some of the cultural references of the millennials or their ease with technology.

For the millennial participants, Sister Hansen said, one of the biggest challenges has been adapting to the sisters' comfort with silence, "the way we appreciate silence, the way we can live with silence." She recently took a group of millennials to a Mennonite retreat center near Grand Rapids for a silent retreat, and since then, attracted by the opportunity to unplug from technology, several of those millennials have returned on their own for retreats.

The guidelines developed by the group include making



room for "generous listening," "extending grace," an "unhurried pace" and speaking from personal experience to avoid generalizations.

Ms. Gordon says that taking part in these conversations has also given her an appreciation for how sisters understand time. "Just walking around the Dominican retreat center," she said, "you can see the history of social activism that they've been part of for decades and decades."

For the "exhausted" millennials who are themselves involved in activism, Ms. Gordon said that "sisters are an example of women who have been involved with these issues for 50 plus years and have found ways to sustain themselves." For millennials who have felt marginalized due to church teachings on their sexual identity, and for young feminists, according to Ms. Gordon, sisters show how to be "women within a church that doesn't always recognize women to their fullest leadership capacity" has also provided a model for seeing "what gifts come with being on the edge of a tradition, and what challenges are there as well."

Brittany Koteles, another millennial member of the Nuns and Nones organizing community, described a similar desire to learn from the activism of religious sisters. Based in Washington, D.C., she spent the summer interviewing women religious on a road trip with Alan Webb, a fellow organizer.

Ms. Koteles, reached on the road, told me she and Mr. Webb had visited eight different communities of sisters over the course of a month. Even as the future of their aging communities is called into question, Ms. Koteles sees the sisters taking the long view when it comes to care for creation and the relationship between communities and place. For Ms. Koteles, that model is a form of the "spiritual nourishment" seekers like herself, who subscribe to a variety of beliefs, are searching for. It would be a mistake, she said, to leave behind the "ancient wisdom" sisters embody.

#### UNLIKELY COMPANIONS, UNLIKELY FRIENDSHIPS

In Berkeley, Calif., I met with Sarah Jane Bradley, who has participated in several gatherings with the Dominican Sisters and the Sisters of Mercy, who are both based in the southern part of the Bay Area. Ms. Bradley suggested a local café that was crammed with millennials poking at phones and sipping kombucha. Ms. Bradley grew up Catholic in Utah, where Catholics are a *Continued on Page 32* 

# FIRING THE CATHOLIC IMAGINATION



MUSIC: MESSIAEN'S VINGT REGARDS SUR L'ENFANT-JÉSUS



TALK: CARDINAL DOLAN

SPOKEN WORD/POETRY

SARAH KAY



THEATER: ALL IS CALM: JOHN PATRICK SHANLEY HE CHRISTMAS TRUCE OF 1914 ACTING WORKSHOP

Poi

ANIS MONJANI



TALK: CORNEL WEST AND ROBERT P. GEO

MUSIC: GEORGE WINSTON

SPOKEN WORD/POETRY: REG E. GAINE

in Aggrican Ideals and 🖉 Institutions



ABDURRAQIB CHRISTMAS: JAMIE PARKER LUNASA: CHRISTMAS FROM IRELAND **CLINT SMITH** 

The Sheen Center is proud to partner with America Media on several of these events!

Visit the website for more details, including live stream events!

# **VIA THEATER, MUSIC, FILM & TALK!**



THEATER: PRINZE - THE ONE-MAN SHOW







FR. MATT MALONE, S.J.

# SHEEN CENTER

**THOUGHT & CULTURE** FOR

THEATER: KEVIN TUERFF AND CHAD KIMBALL



SPOKEN WORD/POETRY: CARIDAD DE LA LUZ AKA LA BRUJA





TALK:

Follow the Sheen Center! 🖸)@SheenCenter



TALK: ARTHUR BROOKS





LEAH LIBRESCO SARGEANT



# **GET YOUR TICKETS TODAY AT SHEENCENTER.ORG!**

FR. HUMBERT KILANOWSKI, O.P. AND FR. JOHN MARIA DEVANEY, O.P.

THE ARCHBISHOP FULTON J. SHEEN CENTER FOR THOUGHT & CULTURE IS A PROJECT OF THE ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK



#### Continued from Page 29

small religious minority among Utah's overwhelmingly Mormon population, but she was exposed to "pure social justice brand" Catholicism, learning about Dorothy Day and Oscar Romero. In her later studies of world history, however, Ms. Bradley, who is an activist for black and indigenous land rights, found herself troubled by the church's history of allegiance with colonial powers, which moved her away from regular church attendance.

But like many millennials drawn to the Nuns and Nones project, Ms. Bradley is a seeker who has continued to look for ways to delve into spiritual practice. The first Bay Area Nones and Nones gathering in 2017 was a two and a half day retreat that left Ms. Bradley surprised to discover that the sisters are "quiet revolutionaries," who run everything from N.G.O.s to retreat centers, always working in marginalized communities. The level of independence sisters have was something she was not familiar with, but as an activist and organizer herself, she was immediately drawn to the models provided by the sisters of what feminist, nonhierarchical leadership can look like, and what "beloved community" can be. "Their way of life," she said, "is medicine for our times." Judy Carle, R.S.M., a member of the Sisters of Mercy, wound up participating in the Bay Area gatherings through a connection to Mr. Muller and Mr. Horowitz. Of those gatherings, she said they usually "start out with just a question that's coming up from your heart and your experience, and that kind of sharing gets deep rather quickly."

Sister Carle, who is now on the advisory committee of Nuns and Nones, says she gets inspiration and energy from the millennials at these gatherings, but she has also noticed that many of them do activist work and have reached a point where they need to take a break "for the sake of going deeper."

She recognizes the spiritual longing of millennial seekers as profound. "Their searching is coming out of a deep place," she said, motivated in part by loneliness in the digital era and the stress of living in one of the most expensive parts of the United States.

Sister Carle, who is "quote unquote retired" from a long career in teaching and health care but still helps run a center for formerly incarcerated women, says that the desire for spiritual depth has been an unexpected experience she shares with millenials. At this stage in her life, she said,



THE PROJECT IS NOT ABOUT 'PULLING IN VOCATIONS' BUT ABOUT 'AN INVITATION TO WALK TOGETHER AND ALLOW WHAT'S DEEPEST IN OUR HEARTS, IN VALUES, IN SPIRITS, TO BE GIFT FOR EACH OTHER.'

"as you get deeper into the divine, doors open, life happens and life invites."

Through the gatherings, Sister Carle said she has learned that both sisters and seekers "live on the edge and challenge the middle."

Gloria Marie Jones, O.P., a member of the Dominican Sisters, agreed with Sister Carle that the depth of spiritual seeking is something the sisters and millennials have in common. Sister Jones recently shifted from being the prioress of the Dominican Sisters' community in Freemont to living in their convent in East Oakland, one of the city's poorest neighborhoods, with a large immigrant population. Two blocks away, an urban farming community called Canticle Farm lives by the Franciscan charism, and Sister Jones has taken millennials from the Nuns and Nones project to visit there.

Of her neighborhood, Sister Jones said, "I feel like this is the kingdom."

The California Dominicans, Sister Jones said, arrived here in 1876 "in response to human need and a call to make a difference." At the first Bay Area Nones and Nuns gathering, she heard much of the same desire being voiced by the millennials, and realized both groups together are "giving birth to new ways" of continuing this project.

Women religious, Sister Jones said, "have opted for another way," a life of simplicity and community-based decision making. For millennials, women religious can provide a model of a different kind of life.

In turn, Sister Jones appreciates interactions with millennials precisely because they offer perspectives she would not encounter in her community. "[Millennials] have stretched me, and I've learned more listening to them because it's outside of my religious boundaries," she said.

For Ms. Bradley, her friendship with Sister Jones has been an unexpected one, but one that she immediately described as "delightful" because it took her by surprise. Ms. Bradley is tall and dresses in jeans and boots; Sister Jones is petite and wears a Dominican white habit with a veil, and yet they spend time together like any other pair of friends. Because there is so much generational separation between them, according to Ms. Bradley, "there's a genuine curiosity."

Sister Jones goes to Ms. Bradley's regular hangout spots and answers questions about her religious community, or they take walks together and talk about Ms. Bradley's struggles with the history of Catholicism and indigenous communities. The feeling is always one of "love and acceptance," Sister Jones said, both at the gatherings and in one on one conversations.

Of the generational divide bridged by their friendship, Sister Jones said, "maybe sisters are the perfect group of people to do intergenerational healing work."

#### THE FUTURE OF NUNS AND NONES

Because nones come from such a wide range of religious backgrounds, including some raised without any formal religion, the question of how the sisters talk to the nones about faith without sounding as if they are trying to convert or proselytize came up in all of my interviews. And in each case, both millennials and sisters told me that the prayer



Sister Hansen sees some of this surge of spiritual seeking as bubbling up from our political moment. "It's interesting for those of us who have lived through more than one national crisis to see how it is," she says, "how you react when in reality, this may be the first time that they've had an experience about what's happening in America. I think one of the things that we give them is a sense of time, that everything doesn't have to be instant."

Sister Carle sees these conversations as an opportunity to do missionary work, in the sense that missionary work has shifted from the work of conversion to "finding the spirituality of the people and to live and serve in that particular milieu." Sisters, she says, are getting older, but she does not see this as an experience of diminishment; instead, the opportunity to connect with millennials,

# NONES AND NUNS GIVES US A DIFFERENT MODEL: AN OPPORTUNITY TO FIND COMMON GROUND AND SHARED CONCERNS RATHER THAN YET ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF DRAWING A LINE BETWEEN A RELIGIOUS 'US' AND A NONRELIGIOUS 'THEM.'

from Isaiah that the Leadership Conference of Religious Women, the governing body of women religious in America, has used for years has become a central statement in the Nuns and Nones project. In Isaiah 43, the prophet says, "Behold, I am making things new; now it springs forth, do you not perceive it?"

For the sisters, understanding the range of religious and spiritual beliefs practiced by nones is mostly a matter of meeting the millennials where they are. The project, for Sister Jones, is not about "pulling in vocations" but about "an invitation to walk together and allow what's deepest in our hearts, in values, in spirits, to be gift for each other." This, she says, is also what Jesus did: he walked with people, had conversations, "and helped them believe in the spirit inside of them." Doing this with millennials has, for her, "opened up the Gospel call in ways I'd never experienced." whatever their religious beliefs, is a chance to "find a common language and come to a deeper understanding" of their spiritual lives. For Sister Carle, out of that arises a way to understand how the church can work in the world.

The future of the Nuns and Nones project is something all the participants are curious and hopeful about. Mr. Muller talks about the "barn-raising" lineage in American culture, the history of collective efforts to help the common good, and how sisters and millennials both like to have a "horizontal rather than vertical infrastructure," one that works more on the margins, is welcoming and inclusive and creates a sense of community that is about the collaborative good, the commonweal.

Mr. Horowitz sees the local Nuns and Nones communities having the opportunity to work together in social justice projects around immigration and climate change, a "shared



social action." Both sides are also beginning conversations about the future of sisters' living and working spaces and whether they can be saved and reinvented rather than sold for commercial redevelopment as the number of sisters declines. Mr. Muller says both millennials and sisters see property and land as an issue of "stewardship rather than ownership."

A pilot program exploring residences where millennials and sisters could live together has been launched, and meanwhile, they hope to keep expanding the local gatherings. For now, however, the priority is to fully embrace the window of time available. It is true that sister communities are aging, and that millennials are as well. For now, according to everyone I spoke to, it is the opportunity for community building, relationships, mentoring and mutual knowledge sharing that matters most.

Between 2012 and 2015, I interviewed dozens of nones for my own book about them; and in each case, the seekers I spoke to said the same thing: They were looking for, and failing to find, a place where they could air their doubts and questions about faith and be met where they arrived. The future of religious life in the United States does not have to be a relentless narrative of decline even as the number of nones continues to grow and the number of sisters shrinks. To see this only as a decline is, in many ways, is a failure of imagination and a failure of communication.

Nones and Nuns gives us a different model: an opportunity to find common ground and shared concerns rather than yet another example of drawing a line between a religious "us" and a nonreligious "them." As Sister Jones says, Jesus walked *with* the people around him. "Behold," says the prophet, "I am making things new."

Kaya Oakes, a contributing writer for **America**, teaches writing at the University of California, Berkeley, and is the author of The Nones Are Alright.

# THE MODEL OF A CATHOLIC TEACHER

Cardinal Avery Dulles at 100

By Patrick J. Ryan

Let me tell you about a Catholic teacher of mine. He was a person who deeply affected my life and the lives of many others who were his students; they in turn affected countless others. My teacher didn't start out his life as a Catholic, but by the time he taught me more than 50 years ago, he was catholic with a small c—open to all aspects of truth and all ways of knowing—and Catholic with a big C, a faithful son of the church. My teacher was Father Avery Dulles, of the Society of Jesus, later Cardinal Avery Dulles. We who were his students as well as his brother Jesuits more than 50 years ago always called him Avery, and we

continued to call him Avery when he became a cardinal. He would have it no other way.

Avery Dulles was born 100 years ago on Aug. 24, the feast of St. Bartholomew, and he was baptized a Christian in the Calvinist Presbyterian tradition he had inherited from his parents. We Jesuits used to remind him that he was born on the 346th anniversary of the St. Bartholomew's Day Massacre of Huguenot Calvinists in 1572, the work of Catherine de' Medici. She had scheduled the massacre to celebrate her daughter's marriage to the man who eventually became Henry IV of France, a former Calvinist.
Cardinal Avery Dulles, S.J., with Pope John Paul II at the Vatican in 2001. As a teacher, Dulles had so much to say, so many thoughts to provoke.

The Dulles family, descended from Scots Presbyterians named Douglas, settled around Limerick in Ireland in the aftermath of the 1690 Battle of the Boyne, and came to what is now the United States in the 18th century. As a family, they contributed a great deal to the service of the United States, providing it with three secretaries of state. The third of these was Avery's father, John Foster Dulles. Avery's uncle, Allen Dulles, headed the Central Intelligence Agency from 1952 until 1961, and his fabled aunt, the economist Eleanor Lansing Dulles, managed the American aid program after World War II that rehabilitated West Berlin and West Germany.

Avery finished his secondary education at The Choate School in Wallingford, Conn., in 1936. When I saw the film "Dead Poets Society" with Avery, he reminisced afterwards about Choate and one particular teacher of poetry there in his student years, Dudley Fitts, a relatively young man who taught at Choate from 1926 to 1941. Fitts instilled in his students a love of literature that deeply marked Avery's imagination ever after. By the time he finished Choate in 1936, however, Avery considered himself an atheist—or at least an agnostic.

Although his father went to Princeton, Avery attended Harvard and later characterized his freshman year there as wild and chaotic. He was nearly expelled because of an incident in which he and two of his friends commandeered a cab left with the motor running and keys in the ignition outside a diner near Harvard Square. Avery and his friends were arrested in Boston shortly thereafter, and they spent the weekend in jail. His fellow cab thieves, insouciant freshmen, were expelled from Harvard; but Avery, who was doing well academically, got off with a stern warning.

#### The Twitch Upon the Thread

Chastened by this experience, Avery made better use of his Choate background as a sophomore, choosing to major in Renaissance history and literature. Struck by the cogency of much of the medieval scholastic philosophy he studied as background for understanding Renaissance humanism, Avery faced up to the question of God only in the middle of his third year as an undergraduate. One February afternoon in 1939, as he wrote some years later, he took a break from his studies in the Widener Library to walk along the banks of the Charles River:

I was irresistibly prompted to go out in the open air.... As I wandered aimlessly, something prompted me to look contemplatively at a young tree. On its frail, supple branches were young buds.... While my eye rested on them, the thought came to me suddenly, with all the strength and novelty of a revelation, that these little buds in their innocence and meekness followed a rule, a law of which I as yet knew nothing.... That night, for the first time in years, I prayed.

A little over a year and a half later, Avery completed his journey from Choate faithlessness through a junior-year Deistic awakening to Catholicism. He was received into the Catholic Church during his first semester at Harvard Law School.

Two experiences of Avery's senior year at Harvard College can give us some insight into the scholar and the human being Avery eventually became.

His senior honors thesis focused on the 15th-century Italian humanist Giovanni Pico della Mirandola, an intellectual whose interests ranged widely over the areas of philosophy, theology, the natural sciences and even Kabbalah. Harvard published it as the Phi Beta Kappa Essay for 1940. The title was prophetic for Avery's later career as a reconciler of differing theological points of view: *Princeps Concordiae* [Prince of Concord]: *Pico della Mirandola and the Scholastic Tradition*.

In another development during his last years at Harvard, Avery joined with another undergraduate, Langdon Gilkey, to lead an organization opposed to the entry of the United States into Europe's War, as they then characterized the Second World War, which



# Avery Dulles was widely revered for his fairness and his ability to learn from the thought of others.

had erupted in September 1939. In the late 1960s, nearly 30 years later, Gilkey (by then a distinguished theologian at the Divinity School of the University of Chicago) came to give a lecture at Woodstock College in Maryland, where Avery was teaching. Avery introduced him, remarking that both he and Gilkey had come to regret their participation in that Harvard antiwar movement—Gilkey as a Japanese prisoner of war in the Shantung Compound in China and Avery as an officer in the U.S. Navy on the Mediterranean front. Both had learned that their youthful opinions needed reconsideration.

#### From Sailor to Soldier of Christ

Just before his duties in the Mediterranean were ending, Avery contracted poliomyelitis while stationed at the navy base in Naples. He had hoped to enter the Society of Jesus after the navy but was afraid that his affliction would prevent this. On returning to the United States, Avery arranged, after a period of hospitalization and physical rehabilitation in Washington, to become an outpatient at the medical center connected with the Boston Navy Yard so that he would not have to make his application to the Jesuits from a hospital address.

Avery finally started his new life as a Jesuit novice on Aug. 14, 1946, at St. Andrew-on-Hudson, near Poughkeepsie, N.Y. After two years of novitiate, three years of philosophical studies at Woodstock College in Maryland, two years of teaching undergraduate philosophy at Fordham College at Rose Hill in the Bronx and his first three years of theological studies, again at Woodstock, Avery was ordained a priest in the Fordham University church on June 16, 1956. He finished his theology studies at Woodstock a year later and went for a final year of Jesuit spiritual formation in West Germany in 1957-58.

Two years of graduate work at Rome's Pontifical Gregorian University followed, preparing him to start his career teaching theology, a task he fulfilled for 14 years at Woodstock (1960-74), for 14 years at The Catholic University of America (1974-88) and for 20 more years at Fordham University as the Laurence J. McGinley Professor of Religion and Society (1988-2008). Through all those years, not unlike Pico della Mirandola, the Princeps Concordiae, Avery worked within Catholic circles and also ecumenically to reconcile opposing ideas and work out new syntheses, especially of theological thought.

Avery was the author of 23 books. His most important theological writings—*Models of the Church* (1974, expanded edition 1986), *Models of Revelation* (1983) and *The Assurance of Things Hoped For: A Theology of Christian Faith* (1994)— synthesized many theological viewpoints and sought to find multiple convergences. Admired by colleagues, Catholic and Protestant, theologically liberal and theologically conservative alike, he was widely revered for his fairness and his ability to learn from the thought of others.

Avery had no special techniques as a teacher in a classroom. He simply stood at the podium and talked. To be frank, he sometimes droned, occasionally writing a word or two on the blackboard. His only gestures were made with his left hand, pulling at a non-existent beard or gesturing downwards in the general direction of hell. Somehow I found it mesmerizing. He had so much to say, so many thoughts to provoke. Dulles introduced us not only to fundamental theology in the Catholic tradition but also to such challenges to Christian faith as the writings of Sigmund Freud, Mircea Eliade and Arnold Toynbee.

In the concluding synthesis of *The Assurance of Things Hoped For*, Avery summed up his ideas on faith in several theses. He began with the phenomenon of faith as "a constant feature of human cognition and existence," a theme much developed in the work of the European polymath Michael Polanyi, whose ideas on "the fiduciary component in human knowledge," evident in all scientific discoveries, deeply affected Avery's theological development.

Avery, however, went much further to develop what the Catholic tradition means by faith as a theological virtue: "Faith...is a self-surrender to God as he reveals himself." In an earlier work, *The Survival of Dogma* (1971), he had developed this theme at great length, describing faith as a combination of deep conviction, firm commitment and trust. Not only a Catholic but an Anglican, a Lutheran or a Calvinist could recognize what Avery was describing—and, I dare say, a Jew or a Muslim as well. The Princeps Concordiae was drawing us all together.

#### **A Merry Prankster**

Avery's thousands of students, Jesuits and others, remember him for the clarity of what he taught and wrote as a theologian and teacher. But he was more than that. The prankster who once had collaborated in commandeering a cab in his freshman year at Harvard still maintained deep within his Presbyterian bones a somewhat more Catholic tendency to elaborate jokes.

One anecdote: Just a week before my ordination in 1968, **America** published an article of mine entitled "Why I Want to Be a Priest." Alas, an error crept into the article between its birth on my typewriter and its appearance in the magazine. I had enjoyed my years studying at Woodstock College and had written in the original draft of the article that "I do not feel cheated by the largely sem-



inary education I have received, though I have to admit that the seminaries I have lived in were academically a cut above the average." Alas, the *not* in the first part of that sentence dropped out. I quickly wrote a note to the editors of **America** asking them to correct the error in a forthcoming issue, which they did. I also asked them to send a letter to the rector and the faculty of Woodstock pointing out the misprint, which they also did. The letter was posted on the bulletin board at Woodstock just before the date of my ordination.

Avery arrived in New York to concelebrate the ordination mass at Fordham University with a gift for me, a book of articles he had just published on ecclesiology and ecumenism, which I had proofread. The inscription was vintage Dulles: "To Pat Ryan, S.J., on the occasion of his ordination to the priesthood and as a memento of his seminary education. Avery Dulles, S.J., June 13, 1968."

In his 39th and final McGinley lecture at Fordham University (April 1, 2008), Avery—reduced to silence by the secondary effects of polio that recurred in his last years of life—still managed to compose some of his most moving words, even if they had to be read for him: "As I become increasingly paralyzed and unable to speak, I can identify with the many paralytic and mute persons in the gospels.... If the Lord now calls me to a period of weakness, I know well that his power can be made perfect in infirmity." Avery died on Dec. 12, 2008, three and a half months after his 90th birthday.

We who were his students over many years remember Avery as a teacher not at all unlike Chaucer's Good Clerk of Oxenford: "gladly wolde he lerne and gladly teche." For his learning and teaching we remember him on the centenary of his birth.

#### The Uneasy Dialogue

In the Catholic literature on American culture published in the past 20 years or so, it is possible to detect four major strategies. For short they may be called traditionalism, neo-conservatism, liberalism and prophetic radicalism....

None of the four strategies, I submit, is simply wrong. The realities of American Catholicism and of American culture are complex and many-faceted. American life has aspects that we can praise with the neo-conservatives and the liberals, and other aspects that we must deplore with the traditionalists and the radicals.

Regarding the church, I would hold with the traditionalists and neo-conservatives that it is basically healthy and that we should let it shape our convictions and values. The first loyalty of the Catholic should be to the church as the Body of Christ. But the liberals are correct in holding that the church stands in reciprocal relations with secular culture. Roman Catholicism, as it has come down to us, has been significantly shaped by the social institutions of medieval and early modern Europe, and this very fact suggests that the church might have something to learn from the American experiment of ordered liberty.

The radicals also have some valid points to make. The church, like secular society, is continually tempted to settle for mediocrity. To the extent that it has adopted the values and attitudes of middle-class America, the church deserves to be admonished by prophetic reformers. Repentance needs to be preached to those within the household of God.

The most fundamental question raised by the preceding discussion is whether the church in this country should become more countercultural, as the traditionalists and radicals would wish, or more accommodationist, as the liberals and some neo-conservatives propose.

Adapted from "Catholicism and American Culture: The Uneasy Dialogue," by Avery Dulles, S.J., America, Jan. 27, 1990.

Patrick J. Ryan, S.J., is the Laurence J. McGinley Professor of Religion and Society at Fordham University, N.Y. This article is based on a talk given at the Center for Catholic School Leadership and Faith-Based Education at Fordham University on May 30, 2018.



# Dulles at 100

**Celebrating the Work and Legacy** of Avery Cardinal Dulles, S.J.

#### September 24, 2018 | 12 - 7:30 p.m.

Fordham University | Lincoln Center Campus | New York City

This year marks the centenary of the birth of Avery Cardinal Dulles, and a decade since the death of this famous convert and Jesuit priest, one of the most renowned American theologians of the past century.

Fordham University, where Cardinal Dulles spent the last 20 years of his distinguished life and career, will begin a year-long observance of this milestone with a conference examining Dulles' legacy and his continuing impact on the Catholic Church in America and in the world.

Featured speakers will include Dulles' longtime Fordham colleague, Elizabeth Johnson, C.S.J., professor emerita of theology, and Peter C. Phan, the Ellacuria Chair of Catholic Social Thought at Georgetown University.

#### Sponsored by

The Curran Center for American Catholic Studies | Fordham Department of Theology Fordham Center on Religion and Culture | Fordham Jesuit Community | America Media

FOR MORE INFORMATION AND REGISTRATION: forever.fordham.edu/dulles100



as we award the 2018 George W. Hunt, S.J., Prize

for Excellence in Journalism, Arts & Letters to Phil Klay, Author of Redeployment.

- Thursday, September 20, 2018, 6 p.m. WHEN:
- Saint Thomas More: The Catholic Chapel WHERE: & Center at Yale University 268 Park St., New Haven, CT 06511
- **Business** (jackets required) ATTIRE:

**RSVP:** events@americamedia.org

America Media



Saint Thomas More The Catholic Chapel & Center at Yale University



# KEEPING FAITH

# Why do I raise my children in this broken, hurting church?

By Kerry Weber



I dragged my kids to 8 a.m. Mass on the feast of the Assumption. It was one of those days where the "obligation" part of the Holy Day felt particularly heavy. There is a small parish within a short walking distance of our home, but we are still adjusting to the logistics of leaving the house with two kids, so my husband, our 3-month-old, our 2-year-old and I managed to roll our stroller quietly to the back pew of the church around the time the first reading started. I pointed out the pictures in the stained glass of Jesus and Mary and Joseph to my son, who snacked on Cheerios while my husband juggled my daughter on his shoulder, slowly becoming drenched in drool.

We make the effort, however imperfectly, because I want my son and daughter to know that our faith is important, because I want them to choose to live it themselves one day, because I believe it is good. And my belief in the good at the heart of our faith is why I have tried hard to contribute to the institution, too: to find community in our parish, to spend hours researching local Catholic schools, saving to pay for them, budgeting to make donations to the church and to Catholic charities.

And then I came home from Mass, and while the kids napped beside me, I started reading the grand jury report of sexual abuse in several dioceses of Pennsylvania. I could only get through a few pages before feeling physically ill and being filled with a sense of disgust and anger and betrayal that I know is only a fraction of what the abuse victims and their families must have felt for so long.

I was confirmed by and was handed my high school diploma by the first U.S. bishop indicted on child sex abuse charges, so there was never any doubt in my mind that the abuse and its cover-up reached high into the church hierarchy. But I had allowed myself, perhaps naïvely, to think that the majority of the cases of abuse had been found out, that the policies and procedures put in place would help prevent new ones and that we knew about most of the men who had covered it up, though few of them have faced consequences.

The revelations of the grand jury report indicate otherwise, and I have found myself for the first time truly afraid of what it means to ask and to allow my children to be part of the church. Can I trust that they will be safe as altar servers or students or just going to Mass? And what I would say if my children were to one day ask me, why? Why in the face of such systemic horrors committed by the people supposedly leading the church did we stumble down the street to Mass each week?

# I have found myself for the first time truly afraid of what it means to ask and to allow my children to be part of the church.

#### 

The priest who baptized my son two years ago had asked my husband and me to do an exercise in preparation for the ceremony that got me thinking about the answer to this question before I had asked it. Write a letter to your son, he said, and tell him what you hope for him in the faith. We did, and we read the letter at his baptism, and recently did the same for my daughter. I have found myself going back to it over these last few weeks, hoping to find some sustenance for my own faith life as well. In reading it, I saw that so much of my hope for my children and myself and our place in the church rested on the belief that, in the process of becoming holy, they might help to make the church holier, too.

The letter, adapted slightly here, reads as follows:

We hope that your faith inspires you to be just, loving, humble and merciful. We hope that your faith inspires you to encourage the church to be more just, more loving, more humble and more merciful.

We hope you find community here, people who will support you, love you, challenge you. We hope that your faith community inspires you to reach out to the larger community—to love others, to challenge them and support them. We hope that your faith inspires you to care for those in need, to be like the shepherd who smells like the sheep, to perform the corporal and spiritual works of mercy, to be mercy for others.

We hope that when the world makes it difficult to live out your faith, you find the strength to persevere. We hope that you find strength in the Eucharist, in the real presence at Mass and in the people of God. We hope that you are inspired by the lives of the holy men and women in heaven and the holy men and women around you now. We hope that you read and learn about your faith, drawing on the wisdom of those who have helped to shape our church. But even more, we hope that you use this knowledge to live your faith—that your life gives witness to the joy of the Gospel.

We hope that you love God with all your heart but that you also know that it is O.K. to be angry at God sometimes, that it may seem God is silent at times but that you are never alone and that God loves you right through it all. That we love you right through it all.

We hope that your faith inspires you to be forgiving, to let go of grudges and malice. And we hope that your faith inspires you to ask for forgiveness when you are in need of it.

We hope that your faith brings you great joy and that you share that joy with others.

We hope that you see this journey of faith as an adventure, that you know that none of us live it perfectly but that we simply try to do it sincerely and with great hope. We hope that you take time to be grateful for this life with the knowledge that this world, as beautiful and glorious and heartbreaking as it is, is not all that there is.

In a broken and hurting church, it is good to remember that the church as an institution is not why we are here or what we are here for. Yet we are responsible for it, and that means holding it accountable and working to make it more truly reflect the kingdom of God. The grand jury report is one painful step toward doing just that.

The Gospel at Mass that morning included a reading of the Magnificat, Mary's powerful prayer of praise. The priest's homily in response was unconventional and brief. He stood and simply said, "Every year, when the Magnificat is read, I just think, What more could I add?" and then he sat down. Indeed, Mary's prayer both challenges and comforts, disturbs and offers some consolation and hope, hope in a God who "has scattered the proud in their conceit…has cast down the mighty from their thrones, and has lifted up the lowly"—a God who will do so again.

Kerry Weber is an executive editor of America.

# America MEDIA

# THE JOHN COURTNEY MURRAY, S.J., LECTURE

Restoring Civility to the Public Discourse

#### THURSDAY, OCTOBER 4 | 6:30PM

The Fulton J. Sheen Center for Thought & Culture 18 Bleecker Street, New York, NY 10012

#### ARTHUR BROOKS

President, American Enterprise Institute

Arthur C. Brooks is president of the American Enterprise Institute (AEI). He has served as president since January 1, 2009. He is also the Beth and Ravenel Curry Scholar in Free Enterprise. Brooks is a contributing opinion writer to The New York Times and appeared on the cover of *America* magazine's February 20, 2017 issue.

> For more information & to purchase tickets, visit: www.americamag.org/murraylecture



The Joseph A. O'Hare, S.J., Postgraduate Media Fellowship supports the next generation of content producers for the Catholic media and other forms of professional journalism. The fellowship offers three recent graduates of U.S. Jesuit colleges or universities and Campion College at the University of Regina in Canada the opportunity to develop their media skills and professional relationships while living and working in the capital of global communications, New York City. O'Hare fellows spend one full year working at the offices of America Media, where they will generate content for America's multiple platforms: print, web, digital, social media and face-to-face.

- Help lead the conversation between the church and the world
- Spend a year at America Media in New York City
- Develop your media skills

Applications open from September 15 to November 30 For more information please visit www.oharefellows.org



The O'Hare Fellowship is made possible through the generosity of William J. Loschert.



# The Rise and Fall of The Socially Conscious sitcom

By Robert David Sullivan

Fifty years ago, it seemed that the United States was about to come apart over political differences. The civil rights movement, the sexual revolution and the Vietnam War were cleaving neighborhoods and families. and violence was thick in the air. At the same time, Americans were getting used to a pervasive form of technology. It was only in 1954 that most homes had television sets, and by the late 1960s, television was still seen as a gadget offering an escape from reality rather than enlightenment. "The Andy Griffith Show" and "The Lucy Show" were the most-watched programs of 1967-68, both gentle comedies that avoided references to current affairs.

Things changed quickly. The topranked show in 1968-69 was "Rowan and Martin's Laugh-In," a variety hour that machine-gunned jokes about sex, politics and religion. "Laugh-In" led the way, a few years later, to a show that transformed TV. That was "All in the Family," a socially conscious and enormously popular sitcom in which the central characters argued about presidential politics, the racial integration of their neighborhood in the New York City borough of Queens, and just about any other topic mentioned on the evening news.

The kind of national catharsis delivered by "All in the Family" seems elusive now. In 2018 we are still getting used to the internet, which encourages short-attention-span solitariness rather than family discussions and the chance for reflection that can follow a 30-minute television program. (Imagine saying that in 1968.) Social media has replaced TV, and it figured in the furor over what briefly seemed to be this year's answer to "All in the Family," ABC's reboot of "Roseanne."

"All in the Family" was widely praised by critics and won 22 Emmy awards during its 1971-79 run, though some objected that verisimilitude was no excuse for the racial slurs and other vulgarities uttered by the main character, a loading-dock worker named Archie Bunker. As a Richard Nixon supporter in Queens in 1972, Archie probably would have been Catholic in real life, but Norman Lear, the producer, made him a Protestant who made negative generalizations about every almost racial, ethnic and religious group one could imagineinvariably having to eat his words when encountering actual members of these groups. When Archie called for the arming of all airline passengers to prevent hijackings, or claimed that God wanted different races to live separately ("I ain't no bigot," he protest Few art forms disappear forever, and the socially conscious sitcom has enjoyed a mini-revival recently. ABC relaunched "Roseanne" in the spring.

ed in one episode, "I'm the first guy to say, 'It ain't your fault that youse are colored"), it was an opportunity for viewers to confront, or at least discuss, their own narrow thinking.

Brilliantly portrayed by Carroll O'Connor, Archie was a complicated character, someone whose racism stemmed from his determination to use any advantage he could to help his family, including white privilege—"motivated not by hatred but by fear," as Lear once wrote.

Lear and O'Connor were interested not just in ridiculing their character's racism but in trying to examine its causes. "How could any man that loves you tell you anything that's wrong?" Archie asks in one episode, explaining how he inherited his racist attitudes from his father. He was a living ethics exam problem for viewers.

One foe of the series was Laura Z. Hobson, who had written Gentlemen's Agreement, the classic novel about anti-Semitism. She wrote in The New York Times that "All in the Family" "cleaned up" bigotry (by avoiding, for example, the most offensive racial slur) and argued, "I don't think you can be a black-baiter and lovable, or an anti-Semite and lovable. And I don't think the millions who watch this show should be conned into thinking you can be." Lear responded with a caustic essay in which he asked, "In what vacuum did you grow up? Not a father, brother, uncle, aunt, friend or neighbor who was both lovable and bigoted?"

In 2014, The New Yorker's Emily Nussbaum gave "All in the Family" credit for waking up a "Brady Bunch"numbed TV audience but was also wary of viewers who praised Archie, writing that the show created the problem of the "bad fan" who unironically embraces an anti-hero. Four years later, with Donald Trump in the White House, critics would become even more uncomfortable with flawed sitcom protagonists.

#### The Political Sitcom Strikes Back

Socially conscious sitcoms thrived throughout the '70s, including Lear's "Maude" and "Good Times" and less shouty offerings like "Barney Miller" and, occasionally, "WKRP in Cincinnati." But they fell out of fashion after "The Cosby Show" revived feel-good family sitcoms, and then "Seinfeld" popularized the "hangout" sitcom, on which adult friends argued about social etiquette but rather proudly displayed a lack of interest in politics.

But few art forms disappear forever, and the socially conscious sitcom has enjoyed a mini-revival recently, befitting an era when the country once again feels besieged by political differences. Netflix's perfectly executed "One Day at a Time" (a loose remake of another '70s sitcom produced by Lear) has looked at immigration and veterans' issues, gender identity and even the trend toward secularism in the U.S. Latino community. And this fall, CBS is bringing back the '80s sitcom "Murphy Brown," though the political content in its original run mostly consisted of jokev references to public figures rather than any real exploration of political differences.

So far, one of the shows that have come the closest to recapturing the frisson of "All in the Family" was NBC's "The Carmichael Show," which ran from 2015 to 2017. It featured a black family in Charlotte, N.C., and explored racial and intergenerational issues (including the rise of Donald Trump), but positive reviews never translated to a big audience.

And then there's "Roseanne." This spring ABC revived the late '80s sitcom about a working-class family in Illinois and drew huge audiences (by current standards) but had to yank the show off the air after two months because of racist tweets by its leading actress, Roseanne Barr.

The original show's politics were subdued, but its characters' complaints about health care bureaucracy and their eventual embrace of gay rights were among the signals that the Conner Family leaned left. When ABC brought back the show this year, however, it was with an eye toward attracting supporters of President Trump; Barr had conveniently declared herself a Trump backer, though she did not appear to be joined by the rest of the cast or the writing staff.

There may have been another reason to pitch the new "Roseanne" to more conservative audiences. The performed-before-a-live-studio-audience sitcom has become déclassé, with many critics and upscale viewers preferring slick, movie-like comedies like the "Seinfeld" follow-up "Curb Your Enthusiasm." Though still popular overall, live-audience sitcoms are



Archie Bunker was a complicated character, someone whose racism stemmed from his determination to use any advantage he could to help his family.

almost entirely absent from this year's Emmy nominations.

This is another unfortunate result of our widening cultural divisions. There have been many single-camera sitcoms that have dealt with social issues and won plenty of Emmys, from the hugely popular "M\*A\*S\*H" in the 1970s to "Black-ish" today (as well as political satires, like "Veep," whose central joke is that elected officials have no ideology other than staying in power). But as the TV critic Todd Van-DerWerff wrote in Vox last year, "Sitcoms filmed before a live studio audience are one of the few places where we can all still get together and argue about what would otherwise pull us apart." He continues, "The leavening agent of the live studio audience...reminds viewers that we can talk about this kind of serious, personal stuff and still find it funny."

The best live-audience sitcoms encourage empathy and openness, approximating the raucous experience of live theater and shared emotional responses—as opposed to the sealed-off feeling of many contemporary sitcoms, often viewed in solitude by viewers who closely identify with the protagonists. They illustrate the Christian admonition to welcome the stranger, and, for comedy's sake, to welcome the strange. The New York Times columnist Ross Douthat, writing during the brief "Roseanne" revival, noted that cultural liberalism is more effectively advanced by "the subtle nudge" of a sitcom than the "hectoring" of more overtly political figures. (See John Oliver.)

#### **Too Close to Trump**

The new "Roseanne" was funny and well-written. ABC plans to bring it back again without the problematic Barr, but the fictional Roseanne Conner was by far the most interesting character on screen, not only for her embrace of Trump but for the notcoincidental theme of her coming to terms with her aging body in an old house (reluctantly accepting a stairway lift, for example). She was the rare sitcom protagonist who was neither an aspirational model nor a cartoonish jerk but a deeply flawed human being. She was also very much like Archie Bunker, taking any advantage that helps her family.

Unfortunately, Roseanne Barr was not exactly like Carroll O'Connor, who was able to keep a wide distance between his fictional character and his real-life actions in the pre-internet age. Instead, she has exhibited bizarre behavior that includes racist and anti-Semitic tweets at odds with her earlier political views and has raised concerns about her mental health. The noted black writer Roxanne Gay admitted in the Times, "My first reaction was that the show was excellent. But I could not set aside what I know of Roseanne Barr and how toxic and dangerous her current public persona is."

That persona may have influenced how critics viewed the show. In one episode, Roseanne's husband, Dan, notes that they have slept through the sitcoms "about black and Asian families," and Roseanne dryly responds, "They're just like us. There, now you're all caught up." The reference was clearly to other ABC sitcoms that aired on the same night as "Roseanne": "Black-ish," about an African-American family, and "Fresh Off the Boat," about Taiwanese immigrants in the United States.

The Taiwanese-American actor Kelvin Yu wrote in The New York Times that the joke was "objectifying and demeaning people of color," adding, "it's so galling that a show celebrating ostensibly marginalized Americans would consider shows about even more marginalized Americans a punch line." The New Yorker's Nussbaum called it a "dog whistle" for "white resentment," and echoing Hobson's criticism of "All in the Family," wrote that the show would be more



truthful if it used uglier and more direct language—that is, if it ensured that Roseanne Conner were not seen as a lovable Trump supporter but were flattened out into a member of the Ku Klux Klan.

But the "just like us" line was true to the character: more sarcastic and jaded than hateful. And it is fair game to note the glossiness of a show like "Black-ish." While people of color are certainly marginalized in the United States, it can be debated whether the advertising executive Andre Johnson and his upper-middle-class family are more marginalized in every way than the hand-to-mouth Conners. ("Good Times" and the early '90s sitcom "Roc" were unflinching looks at families marginalized by both race and economic class.)

"Race is not the only social hierarchy," argued Joan C. Williams in The Guardian, even as she agreed that ABC had no choice but to cut ties with Barr. "Disrespectful images of the working-class whites [on TV] are part and parcel of the cultural disrespect that paved the path for a demagogue like Trump."

Ken Levine, a veteran writer of such sitcoms as "M\*A\*S\*H" and "Frasier," wrote on his blog that he had no desire to defend Barr, but added, "I'm trying to imagine myself in a current writers room, now having to walk on eggshells and analyze every line super carefully to make sure I don't offend anyone even inadvertently. ....characters need to have flaws, there has to be some edge."

Certainly, many of today's single-camera sitcoms examine important social issues, but they tend to be affirming rather than cathartic. "The Middle," which concluded a nine-year run on ABC this year, did take place in the heartland and concerned an economically struggling family, but it was mostly whimsical and studiously avoided politics. In the sphere of streaming TV series, Amazon's Emmy-winning "Transparent" and Netflix's "Grace and Frankie" explore gender roles and society's treatment of older citizens (especially women), but their characters occupy that infamous "bubble" of well-educated, coastal suburbanites with almost identical value systems. However well regarded these shows are by critics, they have tiny audiences and are not likely to prompt intergenerational discussions.

"Black-ish" may be the most successful single-camera sitcom that addresses current events, including police shootings of unarmed black men and other forms of racial injustice. But its central characters, particularly the familiar character of the ever-reasonable wife and mother, Bow, are figures of inspiration rather than moral puzzles. (The same applies to "One Day at a Time." Who wouldn't want to be as vibrant as Lydia, as played by 86-year-old Rita Moreno?) Both are good shows that seem perfectly suited to the forward-marching Barack Obama era.



#### **The Best Social Sitcoms**

For a list of sitcoms that address political or social issues in a funny and organic way— from racism and economic mobility to L.G.B.T. rights and environmentalism—read this article online at americamagazine.org/ television. Many of these shows are available to stream.

Full list of sitcoms at americamagazine.org/television

"Roseanne," on the other hand, may have been too much of a fit for the Donald Trump era. Archie Bunker may have idolized the buttoned-down and knowledgeable Richard Nixon, whom he called "my president," but no one at the time thought a malapropism factory like Archie (who bragged that the United States had the "highest standard of living" and "the grossest national product") could actually occupy the Oval Office. Trump's qualifications, on the other hand, don't seem so different from that of Roseanne Barr, who did run for president as the nominee of the Peace and Freedom Party in 2012.

Especially in the wake of the #MeToo movement and revelations about sexual harassment in Holly-wood, the line between art and artist has become not just blurred but oblit-

erated. "Roseanne" was irreparably damaged by the offstage reputation of its star, but it is also easy to imagine that an actor would be reluctant to damage his or her reputation by playing a character like Archie Bunker or the Trump-supporting version of Roseanne Conner.

We have not returned to a television landscape dominated by the likes of "The Andy Griffith Show" and "The Beverly Hillbillies," but something like "All in the Family" may now just be too much for us to handle.

Robert David Sullivan is an associate editor of **America**. Twitter: @RobertDSullivan.

# **Burning Mouth Athos**

By Cameron Alexander Lawrence

The Chattahoochee at dusk, low in a drought summer. Cicadas humbuzzing the living branches

our smoke rises through—fire of twigs and stormfallen timber, kindled now by cardboard

take-out containers and a dog-eared magazine. One by one, I rip the pages and let the heat

curl them, a glossless wrinkling into gray that once told or sold—it no longer matters in the ash

and I like it that way. Until I catch an ancient name captioned beneath the photograph of a peninsula:

*Ayion Oros,* Mount Athos, a holy fortress protected by the Virgin herself, so the men say.

The first to burn is a shriveled monk, his long beard a white wilting feather. I watch the bell tower melt

down to dust, the domes brittled into breeze. I linger on the site of a cliff-built monastery,

*Simonopetra*, poised on the edge above roiling sea, where the monks learn to lean over death

with lump throats swollen a little less each day. As the fire cracks into conversation, dying light spits

toward the moon. I try to imagine separateness from the world, what it is to wear the silent

spaces of dead men's prayers, a dark cloak woven from nine hundred years of singing.

I warm my hands over memories not mine singed frescoes; the fathers like struck matches

in choir stalls, their klobuks embers lifting into woods, disappearing. These signals

speak to some distant ship passing between doubt and belief in me, each page a song

chanted by combusting licks of tongue about a God above all desire and happiness.

What do these words even mean? They vanish like smoke from the mouth's long *O*.

Cameron Alexander Lawrence lives in Decatur, Ga. His poems have appeared or are forthcoming in West Branch, Forklift, Ohio, Whiskey Island, Image and elsewhere.

# Find Your Center AT MARIANDALE

## **Reserve Your Spot Today**

### Political Chaos Continues — Holy Impatience: Call to Resistance

PRESENTED BY DON BISSON, FMS

#### OCTOBER 6, 2018

This workshop will look at holy impatience and the saints who sacrificed their lives in confrontation to collective evil.

### **The Alchemy of Memoir**

PRESENTED BY LORRAINE ASH, MA

#### OCTOBER 6, 2018

When you write your memoir, you witness the corner of the world fate entrusted to you. Come learn to shape your story. Perfect for new or struggling memoirists.

### The Art of Well Being: Poetry of Presence

PRESENTED BY AMY REYER, PHD, AND DAVID KEPLINGER

#### OCTOBER 12 – OCTOBER 14, 2018

Learn how to make listening to, reading, or writing poetry a meditative practice.

We also offer Spiritual Direction, Wellness Services, and Private Retreats. Get to know the Mariandale Center. Visit our website Program Calendar at www.mariandale.org/events



THE MARIANDALE CENTER 299 N. HIGHLAND AVENUE, OSSINING, NY 10562 www.mariandale.org

# The director who defined classic Hollywood

By John Anderson



How Did Lubitsch Do It? By Joseph McBride Columbia University Press. 576p \$40

Some of the best book titles are calculated to pique one's curiosity (*Do Androids Dream of Electric Sheep?*), while others tell you everything you need to know (*Are You There, Vodka? It's Me, Chelsea*). Each enjoys its own kind of commercial advantage.

But a title like *How Did Lubitsch Do It?* is like throwing down a gauntlet: You don't get it? Perhaps, then, this really isn't the book for you.

But maybe it is, especially if you bring to Joseph McBride's latest enough knowledge of classic Hollywood: knowing, for instance, that Billy Wilder—the great émigré director of "Sunset Boulevard" and "The Apartment"—kept a sign in his office that asked, "How would Lubitsch do it?" Or knowing that "the Lubitsch Touch" was '30s Hollywood shorthand for sophisticated comedy that recognized human foible, and human sensuality, without violating the production code of a faux-puritanical film industry. Or that Ernst Lubitsch—gnomish Jew, perpetual outsider, genius—created an unparalleled body of work not just because of Hollywood, but often in spite of it.

McBride, a renowned critic, historian and author (of books on John Ford, Frank Capra and Orson Welles, among others), is not exactly a prose stylist, though there is something Proustian about him. Everything is explained, every rabbit hole is excavated; virtually every film that in some other book would get a casual mention is examined here in Talmudic detail. If you think, "I wish I knew more about that" about a movie or star, read on; you will. But he also makes us believe Lubitsch deserves it, as do his evergreen films.

Lubitsch's career, and his 70-odd movies as a director—which included such bona fide masterpieces as "Trouble in Paradise" (1932), "To Be or Not to Be" (1942), "The Shop Around the Corner" (1940) and the unparalleled "Ninotchka" (1939)—began, as so many early Hollywood bios do, in Europe. Contrary to what seems a popular assumption, the German-born Lubitsch did not flee Hitler, as did his protégé, Wilder, and so many of the other filmmakers and performers who populated Hollywood films of the '30s and '40s. For Lubitsch, America was a career move.

In Germany, he was a renowned and prolific director of silents, a key figure in Weimar culture whom Mc-Bride assesses as having avoided politics at a time of social upheaval, though there are hints of the satire to come. (The first film Lubitsch directed, "Miss Soapsuds" in 1914, is lost, but McBride wonders what kinship a Lubitsch film set at the outbreak of World War I might have had with "To Be or Not to Be," set at the outbreak of World War II.) McBride quotes another critic, the late Andrew Sarris, in evaluating the Lubitsch perspective: "We shall never see his like again because the world he celebrated had died...everywhere except in his own memory." Readers familiar with "The Shop Around the Corner," starring James Stewart and Margaret Sullavan, will recall that the film is set in a quaint, storybook version of Budapest. It would have been considerably less charming set outside its immediate confines, a studio in the middle of 1940s Los Angeles.

Lubitsch's films and his success were products of what McBride (quoting Jean Renoir) calls the "Berlin style," something the director shared with the even more audacious Wilder. To McBride the term means "a modernistic knowingness, a brash irreverence, a fast-paced cockiness, and a skeptical if not cynical contempt for conventional morality and authority." As McBride also notes, Lubitsch's censors "complained that they knew what Lubitsch was saying, but they couldn't figure out how he was saying it."

In *How Did Lubitsch Do It?* Mc-Bride not only catalogs the qualities and virtues of his subject's work, but he keeps the promise of his title and explains exactly what he means—what Lubitsch did and how he did it. This is evident even during the book's lengthy introduction—which could all by itself serve as a kind of Cliffs Notes for film students finding themselves in a class on Lubitsch. In it, McBride breaks down examples and elements of the Lubitsch Touch. Among them:

In 1934's "The Merry Widow," Maurice Chevalier (a Lubitsch regular early on, and a co-star in his musicals with Jeannette MacDonald) plays a handsome young count standing guard outside a young queen's bedchamber. After the portly king exits, Chevalier puts his sword in his belt and goes to see the queen. The king, having forgotten his own belt, returns to the bedchamber and exits with a belt—but wonders why it no longer fits around his middle. Thinking, very slowly, the king finally realizes what's up and returns to confront the man who has cuckolded him.

In "The Smiling Lieutenant" (1931), Chevalier and Claudette Colbert are sharing breakfast after their first night together. As per Wilder: "Regard how they are sucking their coffee and how they are biting their toast; this leaves no doubt in anybody's mind that other appetites have been satisfied. In those days the butter was on the toast...but there was more eroticism in one such breakfast scene than in all of 'Last Tango in Paris."

It probably goes without saying that the Lubitsch gift for innuendo required for its full flowering a society, and a system, that possessed something less than open-mindedness about either human sexuality or the subtler (or baser) conflicts of the human heart. But Lubitsch would have made wonderful movies regardless, which one sees in "Ninotchka," a film more about sexual politics—and politics—than about sex.

Released in 1939-and one of the reasons that year is cited as Hollywood's greatest-"Ninotchka" is about the unlikely romance between a gigolo named Leon (Melvyn Douglas) and the devoted Communist Party apparatchik of the title (Greta Garbo). She has been dispatched from Moscow to Paris to negotiate the recovery of diamonds seized during the Revolution, taking over from a trio of comic Communists (Alexander Granach, Felix Bressart and Sig Ruman), who become progressively drunk on Western decadence the longer they stay in France. Instead, the diamonds are legally enjoined by the White Russian countess (Ina Claire) from whom they were seized, and who is also keeping Leon.

"Ninotchka benefits from three kinds of barriers to romance," Mc-Bride writes: the obvious political differences between Ninotchka and Leon; her complete indifference to romance while "wooing women is Leon's stock-in-trade"; and Leon's blithe, wry nonchalance contrasted with Ninotchka's utter lack of humor. "You are something we do not have in Russia," the deadpan Ninotchka tells the glibly corrupt Leon. "That is why I believe in the future of my country."

She gets over it, and the script, co-written by Wilder, is full of such devastatingly funny lines, some of which carry a bit of a chill. ("The last mass trials were a great success," Ninotchka reports to her comrades. "There are going to be fewer but better Russians.") That is no surprise. Life often leached into Lubitsch's art. Though born in Berlin, he was the son of an émigré Russian Jew, and thus was classified as a Russian citizen. The German citizenship granted him after World War I was rescinded by the Nazis, who turned his likeness into an anti-Semitic symbol in the propaganda film "The Eternal Jew."

By 1936 he was an American citizen, but he was ever vigilant: "To Be or Not to Be" is a scathing attack on fascism and Hitler, and one can't help wondering—especially thanks to what one reviewer has called Mr. McBride's "love letter"—what Lubitsch would be doing now, and how he would see our world.

John Anderson is a television critic for The Wall Street Journal and a contributor to The New York Times.



War on Peace The End of Diplomacy and the Decline of American Influence By Ronan Farrow W. W. Norton. 432p \$27.95

#### **Bombs over bridges**

"The State Department is dead. Long live the Pentagon" would serve as an equally fitting subtitle for Ronan Farrow's *War on Peace: The End of Diplomacy and the Decline of American Influence.* 

Farrow applies his journalistic skill in this masterly treatment of U.S. foreign policy, with interviews from leading military personnel and every living secretary of state, as well as personal narratives from his own time working in the office of the special representative for Afghanistan-Pakistan under Richard Holbrooke. He also examines the professional careers of scores of diplomats to present the continued decline and future challenges facing the American foreign service.

War on Peace is not an indictment of any particular administration but rather a critical examination of a general trend in U.S. foreign policy. Few if any diplomats are in the early stages of foreign policy discussions anymore; generals are tasked with the rebuilding of civic institutions; and the incentives and programs designed to bring expertise and fresh recruits to the foreign service have been drastically reduced. The Trump administration garners a significant amount of attention from Farrow for its record budget cuts and failure to fill a number of key diplomatic posts. The key offices of the State Department have seen such dramatic decreases in staff that its treatment under President Trump has become colloquially known as the "Mahogany Row Massacre."

Farrow's writing is also not an indictment of the U.S. military. He emphasizes the importance of the military as a diplomatic instrument rather than as a tool of first resort and stresses that it is more costly, both in terms of money and human life, to meet every challenge with a gun or bomb when diplomatic engagements produce longer-lasting security.

War on Peace is a call for a better tomorrow. But facing the reality of a defunded and sorely understaffed State Department and with the growing presence of active and retired military personnel in policy-making processes, it also raises an important question: What hope is there for the future of peace? Without expert voices, without the institutions or political wherewithal to pursue peace, what does our future hold but war?



Catholicism and American Borders in the Gothic Literary Imagination By Farrell O'Gorman University of Notre Dame Press. 326p \$60

#### The outsiders

Farrell O'Gorman's new book sets for itself an ambitious goal: It defines and illustrates a new paradigm for reading many major fictional narratives both within and outside the canon of American literature.

O'Gorman is not the first to expose the fallacies of the "Protestant ethic" as seen in the ruthless ambition of figures like Ahab in Melville's Moby Dick or Thomas Sutpen in Faulkner's Absalom, Absalom! Human lives and even the life of nature itself are cruelly sacrificed by these protagonists bent upon acquiring wealth and renown as they are fueled by their individualistic and monomaniacal ambition. (Think of Fitzgerald's Jay Gatsby.) Examining a large number of novels and stories dating from the beginnings of American literature, O'Gorman takes a closer look at the victims of such ambition and how they represent an outsider's ethos, one that challenges the assumptions frequently embedded in the American Dream itself.

His focus is on J. Hector St. John de Crèvecoeur, Herman Melville, Kate Chopin, William Faulkner, Walker Percy, Flannery O'Connor and contemporary writers like Toni Morrison, Cormac McCarthy

Nicholas D. Sawicki is special assistant to the president and editor in chief of **America**. Twitter: @NicholasSawicki1.

and Don DeLillo. By drawing on their many fictional characters, O'Gorman shows how often gender, race and the physical body itself figure into the ways by which these victims show a nourishing communal experience.

O'Gorman's victims typically represent a lower social class originating from outside the United States, frequently from Latin America. A surprisingly large number of them are, in one way or another, of Catholic origin. In the United States, their religion immediately labels them as alien, corrupted and unreformed. Yet invariably they represent a vibrant, if imperfect, and sometimes subtle affirmation of eucharistic Catholicism against their more secular, Enlightenment-driven and post-Christian persecutors. O'Gorman cites a letter from Thomas Jefferson in which he casts himself as "arousing men to burst the chains under which monkish ignorance and superstition" threaten the self-government of an "unbounded exercise of reason."

His scrupulous scholarship has enabled O'Gorman to identify frequently overlooked Catholic experiences in the biographies of each of his authors. He also traces the early British origins of the enduring "Gothic" quality out of which many of these narratives organically emerged. O'Gorman's book is a bold, indispensable and revisionary text for the benefit of readers and critics of major and dominant motifs in the unfolding history of American fiction.



Social Creature A Novel By Tara Isabella Burton Doubleday. 288p \$26,95

#### How sin creeps in

A thought that went through my head after telling my therapist her services were no longer needed: I could continue to send my mother the Venmo request for the insurance co-pay for which she insisted on reimbursing me.

This came to mind as I was reading *Social Creature*. Perhaps it is because I sometimes have shameful thoughts like this that I can, if not relate to, at least go along for the ride with the terribly privileged, selfish, striving characters of Tara Isabella Burton's debut novel.

At the top of the social food chain is Lavinia, a glamorous 23-year-old on "sabbatical" from Yale to work on her novel, whose Upper East Side apartment and penchant for exclusive clubs, luxury gyms and bottomless champagne flutes is bankrolled by parents living in Paris. There is the wannabe, soonto-be-over-the-hill (i.e., 29) writer, Louise, a middle-class transplant to the city who is scraping by on three jobs before Lavinia decides to take "poor Louise" under her wing. They both have something to gain from this friendship: for Louise, a new wardrobe, trips to the opera, introductions to the right literati types;

for Lavinia, someone pretty (but not too pretty) to populate selfies in her exquisitely curated Instagram and Facebook feeds. It is not difficult to see how this relationship could turn toxic; in fact, as Burton reveals in the first chapter, it takes just six months for it to turn fatal.

How does poor Louise go from thinking, *I need this money more than her* to stealing Lavinia's cash? From getting used to the lifestyle that cash provides to being willing to kill to maintain that lifestyle? To using a dead girl's credit card to start a new life?

"It's a book less about someone trying to get away with something," Burton told me on the **America** podcast "Jesuitical," "and more about the spiritual corrosion that happens when you do get away with something that maybe you shouldn't get away with."

You will not walk away from *Social Creature* with much hope for justice in this world. But you will take with you a vivid account of how sin creeps in when we use others, even the people we say we love the most, as characters and tools in our own stories.

Which is all to say, I'm really glad I didn't send that Venmo request.

Ashley McKinless, associate editor; Twitter: @AshleyMcKinless.



George Lensing is the Mann Family Distinguished Professor of English and Comparative Literature Emeritus at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.



By Jake Martin

CULTURE

John Mulaney's persona was once summed up by his wife, who said to him, "walking around with you is like walking around with someone who's running for the mayor of nothing." He shares this anecdote in his latest Netflix stand-up special, "Kid Gorgeous at Radio City."

Mulaney's success is due in no small part to that "mayor of nothingness" quality he has. He freely admits that he needs to be liked by everyone, and this has led him to cultivate a persona that moves past likable or even lovable. Indeed, Mulaney has tread into what are generally considered to be extremely dangerous waters for a comedian, and those waters don't make waves; that is, Mulaney is inoffensive. In fact, he is aggressively inoffensive.

I am not damning him with faint praise. Rather, I am praising him with faint damnation. Hear me out. The most objectionable thing about John Mulaney, to some, would be that he is a white, heterosexual male. In other words, there is a lot of privilege and power in the white male voice, which, categorically, may be to some objectionable: As a white male, perhaps he doesn't see the urgency to engage in discourses on race and patriarchy. But Mulaney has nary an offensive bone in what seems to be his 100-pound body. He is a throwback to a kinder, gentler time in comedy.

And that is what is so likable about Mulaney. He hearkens back to another era, but what era that is isn't exactly clear. Sure, he wears cufflinks, a suit and tie and doesn't use profanity. But it isn't as if he were channelling Bob Hope or Jack Paar. His work is very much of this moment. He somehow manages to ooze nostalgia, while never being reduced to a nostalgia act.

Perhaps his multigenerational appeal comes from the fact that much of his humor focuses on conflict between the generations or, more specifically, him and his parents. Mulaney frequently acts out exchanges between his childhood self and his mother and father—usually his father, a rather dry, conservative Catholic attorney, of whom Mulaney says, "My dad is so weird, I'd love to meet him someday." Mulaney was raised Catholic, attended a Jesuit high school in Chicago and went on to study at Georgetown before embarking on a career in comedy. His faith, or lack thereof, plays a significant role in his work. He introduces the topic of religion by saying, "Now, I was raised Catholic, I don't know if you can tell that by the...everything about me," while gesturing toward his pasty, black-Irish appearance and his suit, looking every bit the 8-year-old at his first Communion.

Like every lapsed Catholic worth his salt, he takes the requisite jibes at the church. But generally, and unsurprisingly, his material is wholly inoffensive. Sure, part of this has to do with who he is, but it might also have to do with his respect for his parents and their faith. I imagine he is articulating the strange reality of millions of young lapsed Catholics when he says: "I don't know if you grew up going to church and now you don't. Because it can be a weird existence. Because I like to make fun of it all day long. But then if someone like Bill Maher is like, 'Who would



and studied at Georgetown before embarking on a career in comedy.

believe in a man up in the sky?' I'd be like: 'My mommy! Stop calling my mommy dumb!'"

Mulaney admits to being fundamentally apolitical, and indeed there is little political content in his oeuvre. Yet ironically, it is a political piece where Mulaney's comedy shines the brightest. In one six-minute piece in "Kid Gorgeous," he does one of the most ingenious and hilarious political commentaries put forth in a long time. Not surprisingly, the bit is in no way objectionable. In fact, its hilarity is directly linked to its inoffensiveness. No names are ever mentioned; the entire piece is done as an analogy primarily using animals—think Orwell, if Orwell saw the glass half full.

In a world of rapidly expanding and specialized media platforms, there does not seem to be much room at the table for entertainers with broad appeal. It is a testament to Mulaney's gifts that he somehow manages to speak to a large audience without ever losing his integrity or intelligence as a performer.

Jake Martin, S.J., special contributor. Twitter: @jakemartin74.

#### Humiliation, humility and Hannah Gadsby

Hannah Gadsby is quitting comedy. Maybe.

But after an overwhelmingly positive response to Gadsby's Netflix stand-up special, "Nanette"—some called it "radical and transformative," others "revolutionary"—she may not need to. "It's a bit much, isn't it?" Gadsby told Jimmy Fallon, host of "The Tonight Show." "It's a quitting show; I thought I'd drop a bomb and leave. I really thought it would divide audiences, and it just hasn't.... The plans backfired."

Gadsby opens her set talking about her childhood in the northwestern part of the Australian state of Tasmania, where homosexuality was outlawed until 1997. "I loved growing up there. I felt right at home—but I had to leave as soon as I found out I was a little bit lesbian," Gadsby jokes.

Satirical humor is mixed in with plenty of deeper moments, as Gadsby appeals to the crowd about the use of laughter as a way to release tension. She talks about growing up "a quiet soul." She addresses her mother's initial indifference to her sexuality and shares a harrowing story of being beaten up while waiting at a bus stop. She relives her trauma onstage in a powerful, raw moment of self-healing.

Lighthearted jokes take an emotional, realistic turn in the middle of her set when Gadsby talks about quitting comedy forever. "I built a career out of self-deprecating humor, and I don't want to do that anymore," she says, as the audience hushes. "Do you understand what self-deprecating means when it comes from somebody who already exists in the margins? It's not humility. It's humiliation."

Gadsby, who was raised without a religion, believes in hindsight and human resilience as a kind of superpower. "There is nothing stronger than a broken woman who has rebuilt herself," she cries out. In a recent interview, Gadsby spoke about the struggles of female comics, who are always being compared with their male counterparts: "The difference between Louis C.K. and I is, we can both say we're losers—when I say it, the world goes, 'Yeah, you are a bit. And when Louis does it, they go, 'You're a genius.'"

With her appeal to emotion, Gadsby reminds audiences to see the vulnerable, resilient human being behind the humiliated stand-up comic.

Allyson Escobar served as a summer intern at **America.** 



# Whom Do You Serve?

Readings: Wis 2:12-20, Ps 54, Jas 3:16-4:3, Mk 9:30-37

The temptation to use Christianity to serve oneself has always existed. Although Christ taught how to live and act in the love of God, Christians have always found other reasons to follow him. This week's Gospel reading challenges Christ's disciples to keep divine grace the goal of their spiritual life.

Matthew and Mark both preserved a tradition in which Jesus presented children as good examples of discipleship. Matthew used them to illustrate the trusting and humble nature of a Christian before God ("Unless you turn and become like children...." Mt 18:3). Mark, by contrast, used this story to rebuke any who strove to be greater than others. The greatest in the kingdom, Jesus teaches, will be the one with enough humility to take orders even from a little child.

Key to this week's Gospel is *diakonía*. Translators often render this term as "service," which is broadly accurate, but *diakonía* was a very specific kind of service. One practiced it primarily by following another's instructions. People of every social status, from slaves to high royal officials, performed *diakonía* in the course of their duties. In the New Testament, this kind of service has a strong connection to hospitality and food. It is the word Luke uses to describe Martha's concerns (Lk 10:40) and the term John uses to describe the banquet staff at the wedding in Cana (Jn 2:5, 9). In contemporary culture, the closest analogue to *diakonía* might be the work of a restaurant's waiters. These examples add nuance to Jesus' counsel: "Whoever wishes to be first must be like a waiter to everyone else."

Jesus did not end the instruction there, adding, "Whoever receives one child such as this in my name, receives me." A person who understands the Gospel will have the humility to wait even on a child. The Gospel makes a play on words. "Receive" could mean "adopt, foster." If Jesus had spoken only of the child, that meaning would have been clear. By adding himself and the Father to the list of those being "received," he pointed to a different meaning, the sense of "welcome, offer hospitality." Those with the humility to wait on a child will understand the divine grace Jesus has to offer. 'They had been discussing among themselves on the way who was the greatest.' (Mk 9:34)

#### PRAYING WITH SCRIPTURE

How do you "wait on" others?

When have you received one of "the least of these" and encountered divine grace?

One does not need much cultural context to grasp the radical nature of Jesus' instruction. Parents will put down their work or modify their goals to respond to one of their own children, but this is not what Jesus commands. He presents an unnamed child—one probably unknown to most of his disciples—as a person worth waiting on. Few adults in any age or culture would have the humility to take orders from such a person, yet this is exactly what Jesus commands.

Many disciples first find Christ because they seek something from him—hope, salvation, healing, community, esteem. All these are available, but the greatest disciples are those who can recognize in these gifts a call to become like the one who granted them. Those with the humility to wait on the least will be the ones in whom God will find a flawless reflection of the Son.

Michael Simone, S.J., teaches Scripture at Boston College School of Theology and Ministry.

IN PARTNERSHIP WITH



# JOIN US at Sacred Heart Seminary and School of Theology



Oct. 8 – 11, 2018 in Milwaukee, Wisconsin

A LANDMARK INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM

# Discovering Pope Francis

Theological, Philosophical, Cultural and Spiritual Perspectives

Featuring groundbreaking presentations and panel discussions by world-class scholars examining the pastoral theology of Pope Francis from his European and Latin-American roots to his Papacy today

# Symposium speakers:

**Massimo Borghesi Rocco Buttiglione Guzmán Carriquiry** Peter Casarella

**Bishop Robert Barron Cardinal Blase Cupich Rodrigo Guerra López Austen Ivereigh Archbishop Christophe Pierre** Susan K. Wood, SCL



Register today! Space is limited. \$195 to register. Price includes meals at SHSST.

www.shsst.edu/FrancisSymposium Sacred Heart Seminary and School of Theology

William H. Shannon Chair in Catholic Studies 2018-2019 Lecture Series

#### TRANSFORMATION **THROUGH ENCOUNTER**

#### Mary C. Boys, S.N.J.M.

Extending the Borders of Our Care: Why Interreligious Engagement Is an Ethical Imperative for Christians September 20, 2018 • 7 p.m. • Forum, Otto Shults Community Center

#### **Ruben L.F. Habito**

Buddhist Wisdom and Christian Truth: Expanding Horizons of Catholic Faith and Understanding October 18, 2018 • 7 p.m. • Forum, Otto Shults Community Center .....

#### **Rita George-Tvrtković**

The Virgin Mary: Bridge or Barrier between Catholics and Muslims March 21, 2019 • 7 p.m. • Forum, Otto Shults Community Center

Francis X. Clooney, S.J. Hinduism as a Catholic—Finding God in Small Things April 11, 2019 • 7 p.m. • Forum, Otto Shults Community Center

All lectures are free and open to the public.



4245 East Avenue Rochester, NY 14618 www.naz.edu

#### SPIRITUAL WISDOM FROM THE DEEP WELLS OF CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM

6TH ANNUAL INTERNATIONAL RETREAT WITH REV. RON ROLHEISER FEBRUARY 10-14, 2019 | OBLATE SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY | SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS



Mysticism is the best-kept secret in Christianity. Alongside Scripture, Christian mysticism is a rich source of insight and revelation from which to draw guidance for our journey. This retreat will explore the lives and insights of classical and contemporary mystics, Therese of Lisieux, Julian of Norwich, John of the Cross, Ruth Burrows, and Henri Nouwen, to see what these men and women, famous for touching the souls of so many people, have to offer us. How might we live a mystically-driven life?

EARLY BIRD SPECIAL - 20% discount. Registration includes all lectures, sessions, socials, and meals. At the time of purchase, please notify us of any dietary restrictions in the notes section. Lodging not included. Available until October 31, 2018.

For information or to register by phone, contact Noemy at (210) 341-1366 EXT 212.



**REGISTER ONLINE:** WWW.OST.EDU/EVENT/ROLHEISERRETREAT2019



# Scandal!

Readings: Nm 11:25-29, Ps 19, Jas 5:1-6, Mk 9:38-48

Many early Christians believed God was already at work preparing each nation for the Gospel in its own unique way, a reality they called *praeparatio evangelica*. Everywhere Christians went, they found realities conducive to the Gospel, things as varied as Greek philosophy, native Roman piety, Germanic ideas of honor or Egyptian interest in life after death. One essential task of an evangelizer was to find those parts of a culture in which the Spirit had already taken hold.

The very beginnings of this idea appear in this Sunday's Gospel reading. Belief in the good news had outpaced the actual efforts of Jesus and his disciples. Many who had never heard the Gospel preached had still learned enough about Jesus secondhand to be ready to act with great kindness when they finally met. Likewise, an exorcist none of them had ever met was successfully delivering people through Jesus' name. Some force beyond human effort was drawing people to believe in and testify to Jesus' power.

Mark was writing to a community in distress, and examples like this reminded them that Christ's victory was inexorable. Success was not dependent on the disciples; the Spir-

'Anyone who gives you a cup of water to drink because you belong to Christ, amen, I say to you, will surely not lose his reward.' (Mk 9:41)

PRAYING WITH SCRIPTURE

Have you found the Spirit preparing others for Christ?

it was the primary motive force. The disciples had only to provide the words that helped new believers understand their transformation. Though the Christian community might experience persecution, the divine mission would not end.

Disciples could forget this role in pursuit of their own agendas, and these hindered the Spirit's work, as the second part of this Sunday's Gospel reading attests. Some of those who believed in Jesus through secondhand information actually met a stumbling block (the literal meaning of the Greek term *skandalon*) when they met "real" evangelists. The Spirit's subtle work needed only the words of the Gospel for it to take full effect, but the words and behaviors of "actual" Christians could be so out of sync with Christ that they could hinder the Spirit's work.

Mark thunders against such disciples. Better for them to go through life blind or lame than to continue to squelch the faith of simple, kind people impressed with news of Jesus. It is important to remember that this Gospel passage continues Jesus' response to the disciples' quarrel over who was the greatest, which the church read last week. It is against such pride that Jesus here counsels eye-gouging and hand-chopping. When Matthew relates the same tradition, he applies it to sexual sins (Mt 5:27-30), but Mark's Jesus applies it to pride and scandal. The thirst to be the greatest, and the actions that flowed from such pride, must have been at the root of scandals in his own community.

God is constantly at work in the Spirit, preparing a people for the Son to lead. Our job as disciples is relatively minor; we teach the words of the Gospel to affirm and build up the work God has already initiated. When we live our discipleship for any other reason—status, security, power over others, wealth, a need for affection—we run the risk of hindering God's work just as surely as did the quarreling disciples.

Michael Simone, S.J., teaches Scripture at Boston College School of Theology and Ministry.

Have your words and actions helped or hindered the Spirit?





### SIENA CENTER

Engaging in dialogue about contemporary issue in the context of faith



Wednesday, October 3, 2018 Old St. Patrick's Church



nessa White, PhD irituality, Health, and Justice ursday, February 21, 2019

Fr. Greg Boyle, SJ Barking to the Choir: The Pov of Radical Kinship Tuesday, April 9, 2019

DOMINICAN UNIVERSITY St. Catherine of Siena Center

### Embracing the Common Good

Full season and ticket sales at events.dom.edu/siena-center

River Forest, Illinois siena@dom.edu | (708) 714-9105 Box Office (708) 488-5000

#### CLASSIFIEDS

#### MOMS OF NUNS:

Share your journey whether daughter is novice/professed, cloistered/active, all orders. Assembling stories for a book to encourage other moms.

Visit: www.sistermoms.blog to learn more.

#### LANDINGS2, LIFE IN THE SPIRIT.

A new six-week program for layfolk to deepen their spirituality and commitment to Christ. Materials online include coordinator's handbook, program guide, and six content sessions.

Preview packet available at: www.landings2.org.

*Love, Laughter & Living Saints: Short Stories of Catholic School Days & 50 Years of Parish Happenings* by the Rev. Charles J. Cummings, retired priest, Diocese of Scranton, Pa.

### America CATHOLIC BOOK CLUB

The online discussion group for *America* readers interested in quality literature.

#### CURRENT FEATURED BOOK

Our next selection for the Catholic Book Club! It will be Kate Bowler's EVERYTHING HAPPENS FOR A REASON (AND OTHER LIES I'VE LOVED)

- Join our Facebook discussion group
- Buy the book
- Enjoy other reviews
- Read about our book selections

Join us at **americamagazine.org/cbc** 



Bellarmine College of Liberal Arts at Loyola Marymount University

# **Fall Interfaith Events**

#### Annual Fischmann Family Distinguished Lecture

"Left to the Mercy of a Rude Stream: A Son's Memoir" with Stan Goldman, author, professor and director of the Center for the Study of Law and Genocide at Loyola Law School Oct. 1, 2018

#### Bellarmine Forum

**"A Commemoration of the History of R.S.H.M.'s Legacy and Partnership with LMU"** with Michael Engh, S.J., president of Santa Clara University Oct. 9, 2018

#### Doshi Family Bridgebuilder Award

Awardee: Sadhguru Founder, Isha Foundation Oct. 14, 2018

#### Bellarmine Forum

#### "The Good Samaritan: Stories from the Los Angeles Catholic Worker on Skid Row"

with Jeff Dietrich, author and founding member of the Los Angeles Catholic Worker Oct. 18, 2018

#### Huffington Ecumenical Institute Symposium

"Revolutions and Councils: 1917-18" Oct. 25, 2018

#### Annual Kristallnacht Commemoration

**"Letters to My Palestinian Neighbor"** with Yossi Klein Halevi, American-born Israeli author, commentator and journalist Oct. 30, 2018

LMU LA Bellarmine College of Liberal Arts

bellarmine.lmu.edu



# A Hero for All What I learned from John McCain

By Martin T. Meehan

ponent for the presidency.

On Feb. 13, 2002, John McCain and I were standing in a crowded room next to the chamber of the U.S. House of Representatives when the senator yelled, "Quiet down!"

A monitor showed the floor debate over "Shays-Meehan," shorthand for a campaign finance law I had introduced in the House with my Republican colleague Christopher Shays. The Senate version of it would come to be known as "McCain-Feingold." Representative John Lewis, the Georgia Democrat who had become a national figure as a civil rights activist in the 1960s, was speaking in strong support of the bill, and Senator McCain wanted to hear him.

When the congressman finished, the senator leaned over to me and said: "Marty, we're lucky we get to serve with the likes of John Lewis. That's what makes this institution so great."

I have since left Congress and now serve as president of the University of Massachusetts. As I reflect on my relationship with Senator McCain, who on Aug. 25 lost his long battle with brain cancer, I realize there are several lessons students can learn from his remarkable life and legacy.

First, you define your own values.

Of course, John McCain is best known for his "maverick" streak of independence, reaffirmed last summer when he broke from his party to vote against the repeal of Obamacare, the signature legislative accomplishment of his one-time opDuring the 2008 presidential campaign, a woman at one of Mr. McCain's town hall meetings suggested that Barack Obama did not have the country's interests at heart. "No, ma'am. He's a decent family man [and] citizen that I just happen to have disagreements with on fundamental issues," Mr. McCain bluntly told the woman, one of his likely voters.

Ten years later, direct, nonpartisan statements of values like that have been largely lost from—or drowned out of—our national dialogue. Our next generation of leaders can change that.

Second, challenge the status quo with superior ideas.

John McCain was a famously rambunctious student at the U.S. Naval Academy, where he graduated fifth from the bottom of his class. Later in life, after he was already a war hero and had embarked on his political career, he learned to channel his anti-establishment streak.

The senator and I came together because we both saw the corrosive effects of money on our government. He wanted to disrupt our campaign finance system not just for the sake of change but because it was the right thing to do to preserve the integrity of our elections. His powerful advocacy for legislation that many of our colleagues thought ran counter to their interests made all of the difference.

Senator McCain demonstrated that challenging the status quo works

best when you are able to articulate why your approach is the better one.

Third, consider now how you want to be remembered.

John McCain's son and namesake, Lt. Jack McCain IV, of the U.S. Navy, wrote an eloquent tribute, in which he explained how his father survived more than five years as a prisoner of war in Vietnam, "suffering gravely for refusing early release" because he wanted to return home with honor. As the senator himself would later tell the midshipmen at his alma mater, his embrace of honor came from a powerful force: the dread of dishonor.

Today's college students belong to what I believe is our brightest and most talented generation—but one raised with social media, where nothing is valued more than eliciting a reaction. John McCain's example is that no matter your age, your life story is already being told. Never sacrifice your dignity or integrity for shortterm gain.

As our next generation of leaders, college students will have to tackle our nation's most pressing issues. I hope they will look to John McCain's life and six decades of service for inspiration.

Martin T. Meehan is the president of the University of Massachusetts. He served in the United States House of Representatives from 1993 to 2007 as the Representative for Massachusetts's 5th congressional district. A version of this essay also appeared in The Boston Globe.

America (ISSN:0002-7049) Copyright © 2018 by America Press Inc., is published biweekly, with two special issues on April 23 and Oct. 22, by America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the Americas, 11th Floor, New York, NY 10036. Accounting and Circulation Offices: America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of the America Press Inc., 1212 Avenue of





#### **Morning Homilies V**

POPE FRANCIS

These morning homilies from December 2014 to March 2015 make it possible for readers to experience Pope Francis's lively way of speaking and his capacity to engage his listeners with the joy of the gospel message. **978-1-62698-294-9 128 pp pbk \$20** 

#### **Refuge in Hell**

Finding God in Sing Sing RONALD D. LEMMERT

The former chaplain of New York's most infamous prison, chronicles the stories of the prisoners he served, and shows there is no place so dark that God's love cannot be found. **978-1-62698-284-0 208 pp pbk \$22** 

#### Loneliness

*Insights for Healing in a Fragmented World* GERALD ARBUCKLE

Offering insights from anthropology, theology, psychology, and philosophy, Arbuckle explores the cultural causes of loneliness for individuals and societies.

978-1-62698-289-5 264 pp pbk \$28



#### **Beyond Original Sin**

**Recovering Humanity's Creative Urge** DIARMUID O'MURCHU The bestselling author of *Incarnation* makes a compelling case for a different starting point for understanding humankind.

978-1-62698-286-4 216 pp pbk \$24

Catherine T. Nerney

#### **Rejoice and Be Glad**

On the Call to Holiness in Today's World POPE FRANCIS Introduction by ROBERT ELLSBERG Afterword by JAMES MARTIN, s.j. An inspiring reminder of the universal call

to holiness and a practical guide on how to pursue it. 978-1-62698-305-2 128 pp pbk \$16

#### The Compassion Connection

**Recovering Our Original Oneness** CATHERINE T. NERNEY

Guides readers on a narrative journey through and toward compassion for our fellow human beings, emphasizing our connectedness rather than our perceived differences. 978-1-62698-285-7 232 pp pbk \$25

### God's Quad

Small Faith Communities on Campus and Beyond KEVIN AHERN and CHRISTOPHER DERIGE MALANO, Editors Case studies from five continents of best practices and practical tools for creating and maintaining Christian communities for young adults, both within and beyond the "quad." 978-1-62698-287-1 256 pp pbk \$20

A NEW WAY TO BE CHURCH Parish Renewal from the Outside In

JACK JEZREEL

#### **Blessed Are the Refugees**

Beatitudes of Immigrant Children SCOTT ROSE, LEO O'DONOVAN, SJ, STAFF and Volunteers of Catholic Charities' Esperanza Center Eight stories of immigrant children who fled Central America, having taken the dangerous trip alone to escape violence and poverty.

978-1-62698-288-8 120 pp pbk \$18

#### A New Way to Be Church

Parish Renewal from the Outside In JACK JEZREEL

Argues that a true "Vatican II" parish knows that ministry is done by everyone, everywhere— not exclusively by clergy and not primarily on parish property.

978-1-62698-290-1 192 pp pbk \$20

From your bookseller or direct 1-800-258-5838 M-F 8-4 ET OrbisBooks.com





# from William A. Barry, SJ

## AN INVITATION TO LOVE

A Personal Retreat on Living the Great Commandment

An important part of Ignatian spirituality is the retreat. But what if you can't spend time away from home for a much-needed retreat? What if, instead, you could go on a personal at-home retreat with one of the most experienced spiritual directors of our day?

An Invitation to Love provides a practical and adaptable sequence of prayer sessions on the Great Commandment of the Christian faith: to love God and love our neighbor. When we experience God's love for us, we can respond with a growing love for God. Loving God will transform us into people who can love our neighbors too. WILLIAM A. BARRY, SJ



an invitation <u>to</u> LOVE

#### PAPERBACK | 4667-8 | <del>\$14.95</del> \$12.70





### A FRIENDSHIP LIKE NO OTHER

A Friendship Like No Other offers a fresh approach to becoming a friend of God with three wellsupported and practical sections. Barry breaks apart the idea that God is distant and solitary and replaces it with the conviction that God wants our friendship.

PAPERBACK | 2702-8 | <del>\$14.95</del> \$12.70



### SEEK MY FACE

In *Seek My Face,* William A. Barry, SJ, introduces situations and personalities from both the Old and New Testaments to show readers the various ways in which people in the Bible draws us closer to God. **PAPERBACK | 2808-7 | <del>\$13.95</del> \$11.85** 

Use promo code 4892 to receive 15% off these select titles. Shipping and handling are additional. Offer expires 11/1/2018.

LOYOLAPRESS. TO ORDER: Visit www.loyolapress.com/barry or call 800-621-1008.